

Book Reviews

Ulrike Strasser, *Missionary Men in the Early Modern World. German Jesuits and Pacific Journey*. Amsterdam: University Press, 2020. 274pp. €106.00. ISBN 9789462986305.

Ulrike Strasser does not embark on an easy journey. She sets out to trace the missionary practices and hagiographic narratives of a small group of German Jesuits (or better, subjects of the Holy Roman Empire and Hapsburg Austria) who, between the last quarter of the seventeenth century and the first decades of the eighteenth century, consecrated their lives to a mission in Micronesia and the Mariana and Caroline Islands, which were at that time occupied by Spain. Thus, the context is that of European colonial expansion, a context to which missionaries contributed significantly. However, the author directs her attention to those Jesuits who were the subjects of an empire that, at the time, was still excluded from the race for overseas colonies. In this period, a group of Jesuits was allowed to travel to these small islands that had been “snubbed” by their Spanish confreres, who were active in more prestigious and strategic areas such as the Philippines and Central America. Nonetheless, the symbolic value of these islands for missionary expansion was evident. This was truly about bringing the Gospel to the farthest confines of the planet.

However, this exploration is not the only objective of Strasser’s journey. In fact, her epistemological framework is exacting, too. The work is based on a gender study that employs a specific type of masculinity (Jesuit and missionary) as a vantage point from which to observe the practices of – as well as the discourses about – missionaries and the “missionised,” both men and women. And as “gender” always means “power relations,” as well as the social, religious and cultural consequences of these very relations, Strasser focuses with competence and intellectual rigour on both the actions themselves and the German interpretations of these experiences during the period. She shows that the sociologically situated point of view and action of the German Jesuits – male, Jesuit, European – is a fundamental element to take into consideration in understanding the self-fashioning and collective performativity of this group. Indeed, this translated into specific ways of acting and interacting with the autochthonous people they encountered.

In particular, Strasser examines the development and circulation of geographic and ethnographic knowledge that always

accompanied missionary expansion and was especially important in the period under consideration, which witnessed an ever-increasing consolidation of a German identity in the decades that followed the devastating Thirty Years' War. It was in this context that the missionaries, who were subjects of the Holy Roman Empire, developed their collective identity, blending common features of Jesuit masculinity – spiritual and emotional finesse, self-control, courage, conquest and determination to pursue spiritual generative ambition through missionary activity that could even extend to bloodshed – with a claim to further specific traits, such as skills in mathematics, geography and cartography, at which the German Jesuits excelled. These traits further encompassed physical strength, resilience to disease, an easy predisposition to learning languages, and a practical bent and ability to work. They were emphasised in the Jesuits' missionary reports, not only in opposition to the "wild laziness" and disquieting "uninhibitedness" of the local population, but also in comparison to the relaxed arrogance of their Spanish confreres, whose behaviour they had observed on the long journey from Spain and during their stay in Mexico, before embarking on the second leg of the journey to the Pacific Islands.

This collective European fall-out – an essential element of the book – is addressed explicitly in the fifth and final chapter (*Writing Women's Lives and Mapping Indigenous Spaces*) in which the pertinence of the sources employed in the book becomes evident. In this chapter, in fact, Strasser examines a successful German literary enterprise – *Der Neue Welt-Bott* (*The New World-Messenger*) – which was coordinated by Jesuit Joseph Stöcklein between 1726 and 1758 and boasted over 4500 pages *in folio*. Based on the similarly successful model of the French Jesuits' *Lettres édifiantes et curieuses*, this periodic publication described distant worlds and the missionary achievements of the German Jesuits, not only to the younger confreres of the Society, but also and especially to an educated lay readership desirous to improve their knowledge and to travel, even if only with their mind. A preacher at the imperial court and a former military chaplain during the wars that ended Spanish dominance in Europe, Stöcklein consciously sought to legitimise his fellow-Jesuits' efforts to spread civilisation and Christianity. Beginning in the last decades of the seventeenth century, this initiative would be further bolstered by Marianna of Austria (1665–1675), widow of Philip IV of Spain and the daughter of Emperor Ferdinand III, who authorised and financed missions by German Jesuits to Oceania.

The German missions to the Mariana and Caroline Islands were

fundamental to *The New World-Messenger's* editorial objectives. Indeed, besides letters, the work also included hagiographic profiles of the many illustrious martyrs of the mission that are tackled by Strasser in the early chapters of the book. Another feature of *The New World-Messenger* that gave a central place to the missions was the inclusion of reproductions of the maps developed by the missionaries who conquered these isles "lost at sea". These maps reinterpreted the islands' physical characteristics according to a Euclidean mathematical perspective and removing the geographical representations produced by the local populations. In this way, *Der Neue Welt-Bott* promoted a specific model of male domination in German-speaking lands, in which – to employ the terminology of Raewyn Connell – the lay hegemonic masculinity of future colonisers was supported by the accomplice masculinity of the missionaries, driven by the desire to fertilise the newly discovered and colonised lands with the blood of martyrdom.

Alongside his reports of the missions and martyrdoms, Stöcklein dedicated substantial attention to the hagiographies of a few women; especially that of the Mexican mystic and former slave of Asian origin, Catarina de San Juan (†1688). Baptised by the Jesuits in the Philippines, Catarina always kept in close touch with the Society, especially during her long sojourn in Puebla, Mexico, where she died. Indeed, various Jesuits celebrated her virtues in their writings. Stöcklein translated the Latin *Vita*, written by his Bohemian confrere, Adam Kaller, who had been assigned to a mission in the Mariana Islands, and subsequently met Catarina during his many years spent in her adoptive city.

Through this textual transmission, Stöcklein reported on the mystic's visions of the Virgin Mary, who promised protection of the Jesuit missions to the Marianas, whereby Catarina herself became a mediatory protectress of the missionaries and their perilous voyages. Moreover, Catarina's purported sanctity was understood by the Jesuits as a testament to the results that could be achieved through Jesuit missionary commitment. Upon her death, when it was reported that Catarina emitted a white light that concealed her dark skin, those who described the event presented it in terms of a transformation that had begun with her baptism by the Jesuits and was now complete. As Strasser notes about the meaning given to this unusual scene: "Jesuit missionary work can turn any savage, even the most disfigured and dark-skinned, into a European-like Christian" (191).

For Strasser, the contributions collected in *Der Neue Welt-Bott* were

expressions of a gendered structure that was hierarchically organised and that attributed specific roles to men and women, to Europeans and non-Europeans, to Jesuits and lay men. Each group, according to this system, plays a precise, functional role in the worldwide affirmation of Catholic patriarchal hegemony, one in which the European Jesuits obviously played a proactive role, not only in promoting their faith, but also in developing and sharing spiritual and scientific knowledge. Women were left with the informal power of mystical insight and the task of legitimating male action.

In this context, it would have been interesting if Strasser had more explicitly addressed issues tackled by authors such as Serge Gruzinski on the agency of peoples in Spain's Mesoamerican territories or the development and operation of mestizo thought. Furthermore, in terms of the application of the hagiographic genre to female mystic figures, Strasser's interpretative finesse would have certainly produced interesting reflections if, besides analysing the fundamental works of Jodi Bilinkoff, she had also addressed the analysis of this literary genre produced by Michel de Certeau and his more recent followers.

Der Neue Welt-Bott summarised and circulated not only information, but also stories about the individual lives of the German Jesuits that had accumulated over the various generations of missionaries. In turn, Strasser's book also dedicates the first four chapters to these lives. As part of this biographical focus, the section logically begins with Ignatius of Loyola, whom Strasser examines through his *Autobiography* and *Spiritual Exercises*, further developing an essay from 2008. These elements are contextualised within the aims of the study in Chapter 1 – *Manly Missions. Reforming European Masculinity, Converting the World* – which addresses the early-modern urgency to define a new Catholic clerical masculinity to counter the substantial criticism emanating from the Protestant world. In this context of confessional clashes and radical criticism of the theological and ecclesiological assumptions of Catholic clerical ontology, the Ignatian ideal of a profound awareness of the interior movements necessary to optimise active missionary commitment were received enthusiastically by young Catholic men. This congregation of regular clerks, who had rejected the *cura monialium*, and even more so the creation of a female branch, identified in its founder a new model of clerical masculinity that was based on a dialectic articulation between female affectivity and missionary agency that was considered as profoundly masculine.

This process of "male mimesis", which had already been sparked

by Ignatius, also developed around a second reference figure, Francis Xavier, a model par excellence of the Jesuit missionary. In Chapter 2 – *Braving the Waves with Francis Xavier. Fear and the Making of Jesuit Manhood* – Strasser concentrates on the rite of passage represented by the transoceanic voyage by comparing hagiographic texts on Xavier (especially the first *Vita* by Orazio Torsellini, 1596) and the travel literature produced by German Jesuits in the seventeenth century. Nourished by his profound relation with God, Francis survives the dangers and sea storms without abandoning himself to panic, but rather by turning the ship into a missionary environment, one in which to exercise his compassion and leadership.

Moreover, just as for all the other Jesuits who faced the same transoceanic routes, the presence of a range of different male figures in the confined space of the ship became an opportunity to reaffirm a well-defined masculinity, one characterised by self-control, trust and proactive missionary activity. Indeed, moments of crisis often ended with general confessions of lukewarm Catholics or the baptism of infidels.

The act of “generating” new Christians is also central to the subsequent chapters that develop, respectively, around the figures of two martyrs: the Spaniard Diego de Sanvitores (†1672) and the Bohemian Augustinus Strobach (†1684). A gender analysis of missionary action and their rewritings allows Strasser to address the conflicts between the models and performance of masculinity in missionary lands in Chapter 3 (*Of Missionaries, Martyrs, and Makahnas. Engendering the Marianas Mission, Part I*) and Chapter 4 (*Martyrdom, Matrilineality, and the Virgin Mary. Engendering the Marianas Mission, Part II*).

The conflict between local mediators of the sacred and the Catholic missionaries has been the object of many studies. Strasser addresses the case of the first missions to the Mariana Islands, explicitly integrating her analysis with the conflict between hegemonic masculinities. She begins by underlining the strong symbolic capital enjoyed by Diego de Sanvitores, who moved to Guam from the Philippines to launch a new mission in agreement with Marianna of Austria. “According to Xavier,” this was the spiritual achievement of the blood shed by the first Jesuit apostle; indeed, the reference to the fecundity of the blood of martyrdom would nourish his entire life, up to his violent death during the Spanish-Chamorro Wars.

It was this kindredness of spirit and blood with evident Christ-like echoes that bolstered the Spanish Jesuit in his conflicts with local shamans, the Makahnas, who managed the fundamental relations

between the living and the dead. Confronted with the growing spiritual power of the Jesuits, who opposed ancestral rites, they promoted an armed struggle against the Spanish occupants. In the ensuing civil war, which led to the death of many natives as well as that of some Spanish soldiers and half of the Jesuit missionaries, including Sanvitores, it became clear that the Jesuits had fractured the local societal equilibria.

The latter was based on a matrilinear society in which women controlled the resources and organised their clans, while men exercised political and spiritual powers. By imposing the Catholic wedding and its division of roles, the missionaries undermined this equilibrium and revealed the advantages of female submission to the locals – as Strasser comments, “female submission appears the big selling point for Christian marriage for some male islanders” (141).

The social, religious and cultural consequences of the missionary activities, driven by a patriarchal religion and an exclusively male order are particularly evident in Chapter 4, which analyses the missionary activity of Augustinus Strobach. Strasser demonstrates, in an extremely convincing manner, that Jesuit masculinity was only successful in patriarchal contexts – which the missionaries spread – and by controlling the sexuality of others – again, the missionaries demanded that locals reshape their intimate and sexual practices to conform to the moral theology that, from the seventeenth century, focused on controlling the sexuality of lay Europeans.

In this case, the dialectic between “Regulating Self and Regulating Women” (159) is fundamental. In the matrilinear system of the Marianas, adolescents temporarily left their villages to live for a given period in the village of a maternal uncle in dwellings that housed both boys and girls. There, the adolescents were taught to navigate and orient themselves at sea, but they also experimented with sex before marriage, an institution that could be dissolved either by husband or wife. The European Jesuits considered this undifferentiated education unacceptable and even pushed so far as to consider the rapes perpetrated by Spanish soldiers as a comprehensible divine punishment. Nonetheless, the fathers exploited the geographical knowledge of these women who had been looked down upon on account of an inordinate sexuality and an education unsuited to their gender. Indeed, a few decades later, female navigation experts were to help the German Jesuit Paul Klein, in Manila, to produce the first map of the Palau Archipelago (194–207).

Taken together, the various interconnected elements in this book present a compelling analysis of the many theoretical issues

addressed in its rich introduction: masculinities, gender and religion, the global turn, and the history of media. It brings these to bear on Jesuit history in an effective and innovative way, and through an important and under-written aspect of its history – the missions of the Pacific.

UCLouvain, Belgium

Silvia Mostaccio

David G. Schultenover, ed., *Jesuit Superior General Luis Martín García and His "Memorias": "Showing Up"*. Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2021. (Jesuit Studies: Modernity through the Prism of Jesuit History, vol. 30). 930pp. €237.00/\$284.00. ISBN 978-90-04-43308-3.

Why do people write memoirs and why do other people like reading them? Perhaps it is because the former feel that they need to communicate with others (to "show up," as it is called in the book under review), while the latter may appreciate a personal testimony more readily than a theoretical exposé. Whatever the case, as is well known, this literary genre already has a long history, such as – to name just two famous examples in the Christian milieu – *The Confessions* of Saint Augustine and *The Book of My Life* by Saint Teresa of Avila. Also, Jesuit historiography has its classics of the same genre, starting with Saint Ignatius's recounting of his early life, which has come to be known as his Autobiography. Should we, then, be surprised that other Jesuits also practised this kind of writing? One of them was Father Luis Martín (1846–1906), elected superior general of the Society in 1892.

The "Memoirs" were first published in 1988 (*Memorias del P. Luis Martín General de la Compañía de Jesús (1846–1906)*). 2 vols. Eds. José Ramón Eguillor, Manuel Revuelta Gonzáles, Rafael María Sanz de Diego. Roma, Institutum Historicum S.I., 1988 [BIHSI 47–48]) – even if it is problematic to consider these two volumes as the original edition of Martín's text. Indeed, it was not published in the IHSI's *Monumenta* series (dedicated to editions of Jesuit texts) but in the *Bibliotheca* series that focus on studies in the Society's history. There are a number of reasons why this is the case: for example, while the Jesuit general wrote his text in several languages, the editors of the 1988 publication rendered it into just one of them – Spanish. Now, with this single-volume work, David G. Schultenover provides a useful tool for those who do not read the language of Cervantes but

who have the privilege of mastering the one of Shakespeare.

The present book in English, however, is not a translation of the “Memoirs”; it is rather an extended summary of them, with critical apparatus, and including extensive quotes and relevant citations from the original text. Although this choice of presenting the work in a condensed and largely paraphrased format may appear unusual at first sight, it can be explained partly by the dimensions of the original work. Written in the last decade of Martín’s life — it was started in Rome in 1895, three years after his election as general, and continued until just before his death in 1906 — the original text spans well over 5,000 pages or 2,712 quarto folios, recto and verso. The present volume is also large at almost 1000 pages; however, rather providing a word-for-word translation in multiple volumes, its editor set out to capture a sense of the enormous work and to place it in its wider context of that period’s complexities, both in the Society and the wider world.

On the first pages, Schultenover explains his project (pp. 1–12), while the last part of the book contains a commentary on Martín’s narration (pp. 864–930). In this way, the editor underlined his aim to clarify and distinguish his contribution with respect to the superior general’s own account. With the exception of Chapters 47–51 (organized thematically), the present edition follows the chronological order of the manuscript (held in the Jesuit archives in Loyola, except for the work’s last chapter, which is preserved in ARSI); this structure was also followed in the 1988 Spanish-language published version. We know that when Martín started to write his memoirs in 1895, he opted for this chronological format to order the narrative of his life; however, he did not have enough time to finish the project, and the accounts from his later years were presented thematically.

Born in the Castilian small town of Melgar de Fernamental in 1846, he received there his first education in the local school, before moving to Burgos for further studies in 1858. He remained there until 1864 – the year of his entrance to the Society of Jesus. To this part of his life are dedicated the first five chapters of the book. Starting from the sixth, and through the next forty chapters, the reader follows Martín’s life as a Jesuit beginning with his religious formation. Here, the historical context was not without importance, for after his first four years in Loyola (two years of novitiate and two more years of literary studies), the young scholastic Martín had to leave Spain on account of the Society’s expulsion from that country. He spent the next twelve years in France, mostly in Poyanne, where

he arrived in 1869, after one year of philosophical studies in Vals. Having completed his philosophy training in 1870, he lived in the same house of Poyanne for all of the remaining subsequent stages of his Jesuit formation: three years of regency, which consisted of teaching rhetoric to his younger confreres (1870–1873); four years of theology (1873–1877), followed by the year-long tertianship (1877–1878). Poyanne was also the location for Martín's first mission as a fully formed Jesuit: it was here that he taught theology in the scholasticate between 1878 and 1880.

During the summer of 1880, the Spanish Jesuits had to leave France — where members of the Society were being dispersed — but they were allowed to come back to Spain. For Martín, it meant a new assignment, as seminary rector in Salamanca (1880–1885). From there, he moved to Bilbao, where, first, he assumed responsibility of the periodical, *Messenger of the Sacred Heart*, and then leadership of the new college of Deusto. In 1886, after having participated in the congregation of the procurators, held at the General Curia, at the time located in Fiesole just outside Florence, he was appointed provincial of Castile. In 1891, he was again called to Fiesole, where he worked in the General Curia assisting the secretary of the Society, and then, after the death of Father General Anderledy, became vicar general. In this role, he was in charge of preparing the General Congregation 24, which gathered in Loyola in 1892 and which elected him as Anderledy's successor.

In the present volume under review, Chapter 47, opens with this last period of Martín's life — and of the "Memoirs" — the years of his generalate. As already noted, contrary to the four previous periods covered in the volume, this one does not follow a chronological order, but rather is organized by topic. Among the themes treated are the procurators' congregations in 1896, 1899 and 1902 (Chapter 47), the situation of the Jesuits in Spain, and several problems connected with Martín's native land (Chapters 48–50).

Up to and including Chapter 50, the volume's editor follows the 1988 edition in terms of titles and content. By contrast, the last two chapters (51 and 52) correspond to Chapters 53 and 61 of the Spanish edition, while the other nine chapters (51–52 and 54–60) are not included here at all. At p. 846, footnote 1, Schultenover briefly gives the reason of this omission: "to make this project more manageable". While in the same note, the volume's editor assures the reader that "the omission does not interrupt Martín's narrative", this choice remains questionable, given that these were extremely interesting chapters in the general's life and in the Jesuit intellectual

sphere. Particularly relevant for this journal is the advent of an entire historiographical movement promoted personally by Martín from 1892, and of which *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* was one of the fruits.

ARSI, Rome

Robert Danieluk SJ

Patrick C. Goujon, *Counsels of the Holy Spirit: A Reading of Saint Ignatius's Letters*. Translated by Joseph A. Munitiz.¹ Dublin: Messenger Publications, 2021. 134pp. €14.95. ISBN 978-1788123181.

A major difficulty that those who wish to study the letters of Ignatius encounter is their sheer volume, over 6000 of them. Researchers restrict the scope of their study based on various criteria. Goujon picks up the letters of Ignatius that give spiritual counsel, further narrowing down the scope by choosing those that most represent the wisdom of Ignatius in consoling, giving advice, and exhorting. These representative letters also serve as a commentary to the otherwise sketchy and abstract directives already found in the *Spiritual Exercises* and *Constitutions*, a sort of Ignatius explaining himself. Goujon's work under review illustrates this affirmation in a brilliant manner.

The author identifies three reasons for an interest in the letters of Ignatius. To know, 1. how Ignatius helps, 2. how he accompanies spiritually and 3. how he conversed (to discover the use of words, the practice of accompaniment, and an appreciation of what Ignatius was striving to do. p. 8). The letters under consideration in this volume are those that answer the questions that were addressed to Ignatius about the spiritual life.

The book has a modest aim of being an introduction to the spirituality of Ignatius in the context of giving counsel. Yet it offers more than what it promises. It is dotted with many fresh insights into Ignatian spirituality and its history.

The Society of Jesus was founded to aid souls. To this end, spiritual conversation was a privileged ministry of the nascent society. The *Spiritual Exercises* are a part of spiritual conversations in general, a way of giving counsel and exhorting to good works (Cf. *Constitutions* [648]). Spiritual conversation was also understood

1 Originally published as *Les Conseils de l'Esprit*, Paris: Éditions jésuites, 2017.

to take place through letter writing and it has its own specific features. The author explains, in an intelligible way, how the spiritual authors, including Ignatius, made use of rhetoric in order to counsel and exhort. Insights from the field of rhetoric, explained in the introductory chapter in a concise way, shed light on the art of conversation as it was practised and taught by Ignatius. The opening chapter is an excellent theoretical background to read the letters of Ignatius.

Up until the time of Ignatius, while giving spiritual counsel, one usually followed the monastic tradition, relying on the wisdom of an authority. Ignatian thought and writing gave rise to a new style that identified the guidance of the Holy Spirit rather than recourse to authority alone. The question was: how can one give advice to another in a such a way that there was room given to the Holy Spirit as well as respect for the freedom of the one seeking advice? This question is answered in the second chapter of Goujon's book. It highlights the crucial role the rules play in giving advice in writing.

Chapter 3 discusses the role played in decision making by what Ignatius termed spiritual consolations, not so much for the psychological effect they caused, but for the directionality they were seen to give. The advice Ignatius provides in his letters does not tell the addressee what s/he should do but how one should proceed in order to find what one is looking for. The advice given by Ignatius in the letters complements the guidelines outlined in the *Spiritual Exercises*.

The chapter that follows is about the method Ignatius proposed for finding the freedom to do the will of God. It takes up a letter in which Ignatius gives the most puzzling piece of advice to Francis Borgia. The letter was written on 5 June 1552, when Ignatius came to know that emperor Charles V had petitioned the Pope to make Borgia a cardinal. Should Borgia accept the cardinal's hat or not? From the analysis of the letter, Goujon reaches the following conclusion: Ignatius had arrived at a point of "feeling quite free" to make a decision and say, "The same Spirit could inspire me to take up one point of view for some reasons and inspire others to the contrary for other reasons, and what takes place would be the appointment requested by the Emperor" (p. 68). How to remove obstacles to freedom, a freedom that is based on God? As Goujon states, Ignatius advised: "By driving out feelings of being troubled, consolation is the principle that provides the stability with which to advance" (p. 89).

In Ignatian thought and writing, having the rules and knowing

them is not enough to discern well the will of God. One needs to learn the pedagogy of consolation. Therefore, it is spiritual consolation, God's gift, that gives the right direction. Putting this principle into practice in the proper manner ensures that the freedom of the counsellor is not lost. The fifth chapter analyses a letter written, not to an individual, but to a group, the scholastics of Coimbra in 1547. While giving counsel, Ignatius is mindful, first, of his own attitude toward God and then toward whom the counsel is directed.

According to this framework, "God is at work" is the basic principle of spiritual counsel. Yet Ignatius's letters show that, for him, God does not dispense with the human instrument. What if a conflict arises between the voice from God and that of the counsellor? In his role as spiritual counsellor, Ignatius advises that, since everything descends from above, the action of the Spirit is paramount. This attention to the Spirit is made manifest in the letter Ignatius wrote to Borgia (towards the end of 1545) before Borgia joined the Society.

In this book, aside from its historical specificity through its focus on the letters, Goujon provides interpretative keys that can be effectively employed in various situations that need counsel. These keys are already present in the *Spiritual Exercises* and the *Constitutions*. The author shows how those keys actually function in practice through the counsel Ignatius gives in his correspondence. They are historically grounded, too, giving them a concrete character through the letters, as well as insights into the author's world.

The choice of letters is done in such way that, the insights provided by the chosen texts, and the identification of their main themes, will assist in reading the rest of the letters in which Ignatius gives spiritual counsel.

As the author acknowledges in the conclusion, the book moves in slow motion, paying attention to details. He is justified in doing so, as, otherwise, the finer details of Ignatian pedagogy would be lost. Ignatius in his letters of counsel proceeds in such a way that he sees the Spirit as the person's true guide and not the letter as such. For Jesuits and other Christians inspired by Ignatian thought, this is a core feature of the genius of Ignatius.

Until the publication of the letters of Ignatius in IHSI's *Monumenta* series in the middle of the last century, the correspondence received little historiographical attention. Studies such as Goujon's are beginning to make a difference in comprehending better the person

of Ignatius and his doctrine. This book also is intended for those seeking spiritual insights, and more specially to assist counsellors who lead others in those aims.

Some sections of the book appear somewhat repetitive; however, given its spiritual as well as scholarly aims, these may be taken by the reader as beneficial.

Pontificia Università Gregoriana, Rome

Paul Rolphy Pinto SJ

Francesco Sacchini, S.J., *Exhortation and Advice for the Teachers of Young Students in Jesuit Schools*, Edited by Cristiano Casalini and Claude Pavur, S.J., Boston: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2021. 430pp. \$44.95. ISBN 978-1-947617-11-7.

Con l'edizione del *Protrepticon ad magistros scholarum inferiorum Societatis Iesu* e della *Paraenesis ad magistros scholarum inferiorum Societatis Iesu* del gesuita Francesco Sacchini (1570-1625) nell'originale lingua latina e nella traduzione inglese, curata da Cristiano Casalini e Claude Pavur SJ, prosegue l'iniziativa editoriale dell'Institute of Jesuit Sources del Boston College che mette a disposizione degli studiosi anglofoni i principali testi pedagogici dell'antica Compagnia di Gesù. Dopo *The Ratio Studiorum. The Official Plan for Jesuit Education* tradotto e commentato da Pavur SJ (2005); la preziosa antologia *Jesuit Pedagogy 1540-1616. A Reader* (2016) curata da Casalini e Pavur SJ; *The Duties of a Teacher* di Grzegorz Piramowicz (1735-1801), gesuita fino alla soppressione della Compagnia, a cura di Mark O'Connor (2017); *The Way to Learn and the Way to Teach* di Joseph de Jouvancy SJ (1642-1719), a cura di Casalini e Pavur SJ (2020), la pubblicazione dei due testi del gesuita Sacchini sembra completare un percorso che, partendo dalle prime fonti pedagogiche gesuitiche, attraverso la *Ratio*, mette a disposizione opere degli inizi del Seicento e del Settecento e infine del periodo immediatamente successivo alla soppressione.

Le due opere sono esortazioni ai maestri delle classi inferiori della Compagnia. Il *Protrepticon* (pp. 43-283) è suddiviso in quattro parti, le prime due dedicate ad illustrare il valore e l'utilità dell'insegnamento ai fanciulli ("puerilis institutio"), le ultime due, più brevi, alla consolazione derivante dall'insegnamento, alla preferenza da accordargli rispetto ad altri uffici, alla perseveranza. La *Paraenesis* (pp. 285-415) comprende 21 capitoli, i primi quattro sulla fisionomia

del maestro come religioso, gli altri incentrati su consigli pedagogici e didattici concreti.

I curatori del volume premettono al testo latino-inglese un'ampia introduzione (pp. 7-41) nella quale forniscono i dati biografici di Sacchini e inquadrano e commentano le sue opere pedagogiche. Padre Francesco Sacchini è più noto come storiografo della Compagnia, in quanto collaborò con padre Nicola Orlandini nella stesura dell'*Historia Societatis Iesu* e, dopo la sua morte nel 1606, portò a termine nel 1614 la pubblicazione del primo volume dedicato ai tempi di Ignazio e successivamente scrisse i volumi su Diego Laínez, Francisco Borgia ed Everardo Mercuriano e preparò la documentazione sui tempi di Claudio Acquaviva. Nel 1619 Muzio Vitelleschi lo scelse come segretario della Compagnia. Fu autore di scritti agiografici su Stanislao Kostka, Pietro Canisio e Paolino da Nola. Accanto a questa produzione si collocano le opere pedagogiche, tra le quali i due testi tradotti da Casalini e Pavur, *Protrepticon* e *Paraenesis*, editi nel 1625 tre giorni prima della sua morte. Non è ancora noto il periodo di composizione dei due libretti, indirizzati ai maestri delle classi inferiori della Compagnia. Francesco Sacchini aveva insegnato soltanto qualche anno nel corso inferiore durante il suo periodo di formazione e non risulta che abbia contribuito alla stesura della *Ratio studiorum*. Nel 1614 aveva pubblicato un libretto dal titolo *De ratione libros cum profectu legendi libellus*, nel quale con uno stile familiare aveva sottolineato l'importanza della lettura, raccomandato gli autori migliori, consigliato una lettura regolata e fornito raccomandazioni e consigli ripresi nel *Protrepticon* e nella *Paraenesis*.

Secondo i curatori del volume, padre Sacchini scelse per i testi editi nel 1625 due differenti stili di esortazione sul fondamento della tradizione retorica classica. Pertanto, si trovano l'incoraggiamento dei maestri mediante l'arte della persuasione morale nel *Protrepticon* e consigli per la concreta attività pedagogica e didattica nella *Paraenesis*. In entrambi i testi erano veicolati i fondamenti dell'educazione nelle classi inferiori dei collegi gesuitici che prevedeva l'apprendimento delle lettere, degli elementi essenziali della fede cristiana e dei buoni costumi.

Dopo aver esaminato i motivi storici che a inizi del secolo XVII rendevano poco attraente nella Compagnia l'ufficio di insegnare, nel commentare il *Protrepticon* Casalini e Pavur delineano innanzitutto i lettori ai quali Sacchini si rivolgeva: religiosi della Compagnia che esercitavano il ministero dell'insegnamento o che stavano per assumerlo. Di conseguenza Sacchini avrebbe esaminato gli aspetti pertinenti alla specifica identità gesuitica, attenzione presente

anche nella *Paraenesis*, evidenziando il legame tra l'insegnamento e la vocazione alla Compagnia. L'esaltazione della centralità della grammatica nel percorso di apprendimento presente nella prima parte del *Protrepticon* sarebbe derivata a Sacchini dal pensiero umanistico, mentre descrivere l'arte di educare alla stregua della pittura e della scultura in base alla convinzione che i bambini possedessero una mente malleabile è associato al dibattito del primo barocco italiano sulle belle arti. L'elenco degli effetti positivi delle scuole gesuitiche della seconda parte viene accostato alla lista dei quindici benefici di Polanco del 1560. Riguardo alla terza e quarta parte, più brevi, i curatori notano che Sacchini evidenzia la consolazione derivante ai maestri dal progresso morale degli studenti, ma soprattutto sottolineano che in quelle pagine diventa evidente il potenziale conflitto tra la vocazione dei giovani gesuiti e l'insegnamento. A tal fine Sacchini presenta tale ministero come preferibile ad ogni altro e li esorta ad avere lo stesso zelo dei loro compagni missionari sparsi per il mondo.

Circa la *Paraenesis* l'introduzione di Casalini e Pavur nota come Sacchini sia in sintonia con il pensiero pedagogico gesuita secondo il quale al maestro accanto al sapere siano necessarie qualità psicologiche, specifici abiti morali e conoscenza dei metodi didattici adeguati. Come per molti umanisti del Rinascimento anche per Sacchini risulterebbe fondamentale l'esemplarità del maestro, declinata secondo precise qualità. I curatori evidenziano anche come nella *Paraenesis* il gesuita offra consigli pratici per applicare la *Ratio studiorum* e vi si trovino gli elementi pedagogici tipici delle scuole gesuitiche della prima età moderna: esercitazioni degli studenti mediante composizioni e ripetizioni, sostegno allo studio del greco, importanza dei premi e dell'emulazione. Il consiglio di essere prudenti nel ricorrere alle punizioni e ai rimproveri dimostrerebbe la consolidata scelta della *suavitas* nell'educazione dei giovani da parte dei gesuiti, alla quale viene aggiunta la capacità di amabile interazione con studenti, colleghi e famiglie.

I curatori presentano lo stile di Sacchini come caratterizzato da una prosa latina classica di eleganza ciceroniana. In Sacchini vi sarebbe un appello più alla volontà che alla mente, con un'attitudine drammatica e l'appello alle passioni. Nei due testi viene riscontrata una vasta erudizione con numerose citazioni bibliche e classiche, provenienti da fonti patristiche, medievali e più recenti. La sua scrittura rivelerebbe il carattere di Sacchini, definito "a superlatively learned, spiritual, artful, passionate, and eloquent author of great scope and devotion" (p. 37).

Lo studio introduttivo si chiude con un *excursus* sulla recezione delle due opere, che rimase all'interno della Compagnia, e sulle motivazioni per rileggere Sacchini: le sue opere sarebbero espressione matura dell'impostazione educativa umanistica cristiana e permetterebbero di cogliere il mondo scolastico descritto. Si sottolinea come nei due scritti si trovino contemporaneamente istruzioni dettagliate e un profondo senso del significato spirituale e sociale dell'insegnamento e dell'apprendimento e come per Sacchini si trattasse di una questione di salvezza della persona. I curatori ritengono infine che la lettura di Sacchini sia sempre attuale e che offra anche la possibilità di scoprire l'autore stesso e la sua ricca vita interiore. Un indice analitico e dei nomi conclude il volume (pp. 416-430).

Il volume curato da Casalini e Pavur offre ai lettori anglofoni un testo di grande interesse sia per la riflessione pedagogica sia per i consigli didattici sia per lo studio della personalità di Sacchini. Oltre a quanto già notato nel saggio introduttivo, va sottolineata la connotazione quasi mistica dell'insegnamento per Sacchini: il maestro doveva entrare nella sua azione educativa nella preghiera e invocare l'assistenza degli angeli custodi dei suoi alunni. Anche in questo caso il gesuita è pensato come un contemplativo in azione, secondo la ben nota definizione di Jerónimo Nadal.

Due episodi narrati da un gesuita di Parma, padre Orazio Smeraldi (1592-1672), confermano quanto si rivelasse opportuna nei primi decenni del Seicento un'esortazione a riconoscere la dignità e il valore dell'insegnamento nelle classi inferiori, demandato per lo più ai giovani gesuiti. La convinzione che "il fare scuola", tipico della Compagnia, fosse "impresa di gran molestia e malagevole" aveva fatto inclinare inizialmente, nel 1614, il fratello di padre Smeraldi, Francesco (era stato scolaro nelle scuole di San Rocco a Parma), verso lo stato di eremita o di cappuccino. Divenne tuttavia in seguito un ottimo gesuita insegnante. Francesco Milanini, maestro di retorica nel collegio di San Rocco a Parma, giovane e in buona salute, morì invece improvvisamente nel 1618 mentre faceva lezione, non avendo retto, secondo padre Orazio, alla "scostumatezza" e "protervia" di alcuni scolari e avvelenato da tale "audace ingratitudine" (Parma. Biblioteca Palatina, Ms. Parmense 1414, Orazio Smeraldi, *Memorie de' padri e fratelli parmigiani che sono entrati e morti nella Compagnia di Gesù dal principio di essa Compagnia, cioè dall'anno 1540 sino all'anno 1666, ad vocem*).

Anche letteralmente l'insegnamento nelle classi inferiori poteva diventare quel "martirio" evocato dal titolo di uno dei paragrafi dell'introduzione di Casalini e Pavur: *Teaching the Lower Classes – A*

Jesuit "Martyrdom"?. Padre Sacchini rispose contemporaneamente con le motivazioni e con i suggerimenti pratici, lasciando due testi importanti per lo studio dell'attività pedagogica e didattica dei gesuiti dopo la *Ratio studiorum*.

Università degli Studi di Pavia

Miriam Turrini

Ananya Chakravarti, *The Empire of Apostles: Religion, Accommodation, and the Imagination of Empire in Early Modern Brazil and India*. (2018). Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2018. 355pp. ISBN 9780199485086.

Ananya Chakravarti's *The Empire of Apostles* is a unique and ambitious contribution to the field of Jesuit studies, and the history of colonialism and Christian missions in a number of ways. While the historiography is rich on these topics for both the Americas and South Asia, this book offers a connected and comparative take on the intertwining of colonialism and mission in both disparate regions, uniting them through the transregional ministrations of the Society of Jesus, the Portuguese empire, and the contemporary European intellectual terrain that was applied by missionaries in creative ways to apprehend the social, religious and linguistic realities found in both Brazil and India and guide their mission strategy accordingly.

Chakravarti accomplishes this primarily through the lenses provided by six missionary figures — Francis Xavier, Manuel de Nóbrega, José de Anchieta, Thomas Stephens, António Viera, and Baltazar da Costa. But to say this is history through biography is not quite accurate, for her attention lies in a detailed analysis of these missionaries' writings and ideas — which range from ethnography, to theology, ethics, politics, cosmology, soteriology and mystical revelations — more than their personalities. In taking this approach, the author wades deeply in the waters of the European intellectual milieu as it developed in the early modern period, modifying Medieval scholasticism with Renaissance humanism, while guided to a great extent by the colonial encounter and the on-the-ground thinking and writing of figures such as these missionaries.

As the book intends to decolonize empire and Church history in India and Brazil under Portuguese colonialism during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, the reader is likely to wonder about the role of indigenous source material in reading against the colonial and missionary archive. Chakravarti deals with this question explicitly

in the first chapter, and her method skilfully permeates all the chapters. In the Indian case there is ample extant material generated by existing Indian polities and the rich literary cultures with which the Portuguese interacted. In the case of colonial Brazil — despite the paucity of indigenous sources available — the book does not come across lopsided or unaccomplished in its stated intent. Chakravarti's reading of missionary and colonial writings against the grain, augmented by other scholarship on indigenous society, reveal a surprisingly rich, nuanced and clear picture of Tupí cosmology, warrior culture, ethics, and social formation. It also shows that understanding, rather than misapprehension, was usually in the possession of her missionary subjects, even if their intentions were radically to reshape indigenous thinking, belief and ethics — for instance, to replace the warrior culture with an orientation towards peace guaranteed by centralized sovereignty and nomadism with sedentary productivity, and to reinterpret indigenous demons as manifestations of Satan at odds with Christ and his ministers (the missionaries themselves).

The book traces an interesting evolution in missionary attitudes towards the indigenous peoples of Brazil and India, which creatively put missionary experience of indigenous Indians and Brazilian groups in dialogue with medieval mythic notions of lost Christian communities and kings (such as Prester John); framed new world natives as *tabula rasa* peoples (ideal potential Christians in a new Eden); drew on a panoply of Christian thought from Augustine through Aquinas (about how faith was to be received whether by the heart or intellect), as well as influences from Renaissance humanism. Jesuit experiments like *accommodatio* of cultural, symbolic, social, linguistic and sartorial practices show how the colonial space was for these missionaries an essential arena of production for European thought through interaction with difference.

Chakravarti gives significant attention to the conversion strategies pursued by Jesuits. While *accommodatio* is well known as a Jesuit mission strategy, especially in South Asia and East Asia, the evangelization and education of children who would in turn evangelize their older relatives is probably less well known, and the author demonstrates this with rich examples of it from both Brazil and India.

The organizing principle of the last two chapters shift from a focus on particular missionaries to analysis of just how these missionary endeavours interacted with the shifting politics of empire during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Portugal came under the

control of the Spanish crown from 1580-1640. The rise of Dutch power, especially in South and Southeast Asia, but also in the south Atlantic on the Brazilian coast, constituted a radical loss of Portuguese territory, trade and influence in South Asia and a substantial nuisance in Brazil. Missionaries reacted at times showing their political loyalties, interpreting Portuguese decline as punishment for sin, or even with millenarian visions regarding the relation of empire to the end times and reign of God.

Yet perhaps the author's laudable practice of keeping a close focus on the texts impeded a more concrete theorization of the ambiguous relationship between Jesuits and empire. For example, in India the Jesuits did their most creative works of *accommodatio* where imperial power was weakest or non-existent, beyond the Portuguese and Catholic power centre of Goa. In Brazil, imperial power was helpful to the Jesuit mission cause by bringing about 'pacification' and instituting the *aldeia* system, and yet at other times was a great hindrance for its inaction against the enslavement of natives. Moreover, the self-fashioning and rhetorical elements present in Jesuit treatises, epistolary traditions and other writings that create the sort of *imaginaire* Chakravarti takes up in the final chapter could have been discussed in relation to two earlier seminal works: Ines Županov's *Missionary Tropics* (2005) on the meaning of Jesuit writing practices in the larger scheme of missions and empire; and Županov and Angela Bareto Xavier's *Catholic Orientalism* (2015) that contend that this very intellectual world within the Portuguese empire constitutes a type of orientalism that in fact precedes and forms the foundations of the orientalism of the later French and British empires in Asia.

Whatever minor reservations one may have with this book, they are far outweighed by the extraordinary intellectual ambition the author has shown in taking up this intercontinental comparative study; the linguistic prowess to interpret vast sources in multiple languages; the in-depth understanding of multiple philosophical, theological and cosmological positions that span three continents, and the capacity to so capably put these elements into dialogue. This work will no doubt be of interest to historians of the Portuguese empire, Jesuit studies scholars of both historical and theological specialisations, and scholars of both early modern South Asia and Brazil.

Raphaële Garrod and Yasmin Haskell, eds, *Changing Hearts: Performing Jesuit Emotions Between Europe, Asia, and the Americas*. Leiden-Boston: Brill. 328pp. €130.00/\$157.00. ISBN 978-90-04-38519-1.

This edited volume investigates the role of “emotions” in the Society of Jesus during the early modern period, as “performed” by its members in different scenarios: missions, theatres, and art works. Published in January 2019, it consists of a preface by Jan Bloemendal, an introduction by the editors Raphaële Garrod and Yasmin Haskell, and twelve essays.

As noted in the “Preface,” the recent “affective turn” in the Humanities brought “fresh attention to passions, affects, and emotions” (p. x). As for the latter term, it can indeed confuse and look anachronistic, because early modern writers used words like *affects*, *passions*, or *humours* to describe (mainly in a philosophical context) what we call today *emotions*. However, the “history of emotions” has recently become an important historiographical branch, and this book is one of the outcomes of the research project of the Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, 1100-1800, based at the University of Western Australia, Perth.

Another distinctive element of the book’s conceptual framing is reflected in the subtitle of the book, “Performing Jesuit Emotions.” As the contributors argue, there are no set “Jesuit emotions” nor a specific way in which they “performed” them. To be sure, the members of the Society of Jesus “did employ affects and emotions with unusual effectiveness ... they tried to influence and indoctrinate their audiences ... and convert them” (p. xiii). They also recorded them. For this reason, as pointed out in the “Introduction” by Garrod and Haskell, the Society of Jesus, with its wealth of well-preserved documentary output, represents a rich mine for exploring the multiple ways Jesuits represented emotions in this period across numerous geographical locations. The documents further allow historians to profitably study Jesuit theorizations on the subject, and their practice through different kinds of performances. Of course, the Society did not act or think in a vacuum: in terms of its views of emotions, it shared with other religious orders the frameworks provided by Aristotle (*On the Soul*; *Nicomachean Ethics*) and Thomas Aquinas (*Prima secundae*). According to the early-modern views based on these theories, “images generate specific affective responses, which, in turn, drive action” (p. 4). Consequently, the repetition of pious practices was supposed to create a pious person.

Throughout the entire book, the contributors enlighten the readers

on how Jesuits used imagination to generate affects to induce a real, concrete change in the worshipper's soul and attitude (the "change of hearts" of the title). The first group of essays focuses on Jesuit theatre. Garrod, Haskell, and Nienke Tjoelker show how dramas were one of the most powerful ways to put Jesuit pedagogy into practice, often by referring to classic models in a Christianized version (Seneca above all).

The second section deals with the Other. The Society of Jesus, since its foundation, was a missionary order that came into contact with perhaps the largest variety of cultural and social realities in the known world, compared with any other European group. Both in the East and West Indies, Jesuits had to find the right way to proselytize the local people, and keep them among their ranks once converted. Makoto Harris Takao, Maya Feile Tomes, Peter O'Brien, and John Gallucci respectively study the Jesuit interaction with Japanese, Americans, aboriginal Canadians, and the population of New France. These missions were of the utmost significance also because many Jesuits experienced persecution and met a violent death – which in turn were represented in martyrological accounts for European readership – and spectatorship as well.

The final part of *Changing Hearts* analyses visual and musical sources, also including festive *apparati*. About the latter topic, the essay by Ralph Dekoninck, Maarten Delbeke, Annick Delfosse, and Koen Vermeir deals with an elaborate celebration in the Netherlands in 1622 of the Society's canonizations (of Ignatius of Loyola, 1491–1556, founder of the Society of Jesus, and Francis Xavier, 1506–52, known as 'the Apostle of the Indies'). David Irving focuses on music and dance in the Marianas islands, while Juan Luis González García examines the relevance of rhetoric in European popular missions. The last essay, written by one of the most authoritative scholars of the history of emotions, Susan Broomhall, highlights two relevant aspects of this historiographical approach: the importance of non-textual (visual and material) sources on the one hand, and of a global perspective on the other hand. Broomhall skilfully concludes the section with an essay on "Jesuitware," that is porcelain with a religious subject "used in visual preaching", demonstrating how artefacts were not simply passive objects, but could become "eloquent actors in the early modern Jesuit emotional economy" (p. 18).

The last, unnumbered chapter is dedicated to the recent rediscovery of a painting by Tintoretto (1519–94). Paola di Rico and Marina Viganò describe this portrait of a Japanese boy, part of the Tenshō embassy organized by Alessandro Valignano (1539–1606) to

show to Europe this magnificent, unknown civilization – and *vice versa*. Mancio Ito's picture appears on the cover of *Changing Hearts*, while inside the volume, several other images are included, such as frontispieces, a music score, paintings, and engravings.

This book, part of the *Jesuit Studies* series, offers for the first time a collection of essays that focus with an innovative perspective on (often overlooked) Jesuit sources. A theoretical overview of the history of emotions in a Jesuit context is followed by multiple case-studies examined by the most important scholars in the field. It efficaciously studies the concrete ways in which emotions were used to “change hearts” of early modern people all over the world (while bringing them under the aegis of this Catholic institution), and it will hopefully encourage further studies on this fascinating topic.

Boston College – Università degli Studi di Macerata Elisa Frei

Giovanni Isgrò, *Il teatro dei Gesuiti. La pedagogia teatrale, la scena europea, il teatro di evangelizzazione*. Bari: Edizioni di Pagina, 2021. 228 pp. € 18.00. ISBN 978-88-7470-827-7.

Non è la prima volta che Giovanni Isgrò incontra il teatro dei Gesuiti, avventurandosi in quella che per molto tempo è stata, secondo una definizione datane da Cesare Questa più di vent'anni or sono, una “vera e propria *terra incognita*”. Grazie alle ricerche di studiosi italiani e stranieri, compreso, soprattutto per quanto concerne la scenotecnica, lo stesso Isgrò, molto conosciamo ormai di quel teatro e della sua storia.

Di quest'ultima l'autore ripercorre nel libro in oggetto le tappe fondamentali, anche quelle preparatorie, evidenzia ancora una volta le caratteristiche tanto contenutistiche che formali e drammaturgiche del teatro recitato nei collegi dei Gesuiti, spinge lo sguardo oltre i confini dell'Italia e dell'Europa, approdando da ultimo fino al lontano Giappone. Possiamo dire che, in un certo senso, lo studioso si muove sulle orme di quella Compagnia di Gesù che, nella propria opera di diffusione e protezione della fede fece della parola, anche di quella recitata dal pulpito e dal palcoscenico, uno strumento fondamentale.

Due grandi oratori e drammaturghi gesuiti italiani furono per esempio Stefano Tuccio, attivo presso il Collegio Mamertino di

Messina, e Bernardino Stefonio, iniziatore della cosiddetta tragedia del martire; su di essi, soprattutto sul primo, l'autore si sofferma diffusamente. Tra gli autori considerati rappresentativi in ambito europeo avrebbe probabilmente meritato uno spazio più ampio il pur ricordato Miguel Venegas.

Tornando al recitare nei collegi dei Gesuiti, che esso non sia stato un puro divertimento, ma un'attività curricolare è ben noto; altrettanto lo è il suo far parte di quell'educazione olistica e armoniosa che veniva impartita nelle scuole dei Padri. Se erano questi ultimi a scrivere i testi, soprattutto tragedie latine, come si sa, erano gli allievi a recitarli. Giovanni Isgrò sottolinea, se ancora ce ne fosse bisogno, la solida preparazione, anche retorica, dei giovani, le lunghe esercitazioni che rientravano nella prassi scolastica quotidiana, la capacità di muoversi e di gestire che si richiedeva ai frequentanti i quali, non necessariamente destinati alla vita religiosa, dovevano essere comunque pronti a entrare nel mondo.

Teatro di formazione per chi recita dunque, ma anche, forse soprattutto, teatro di formazione per chi guarda. È, quello dei Gesuiti, un teatro che comunica un messaggio non soltanto morale, ma di fede, proponendo altresì, ai giovani e non solo, modelli da imitare. Modelli di vita, ma anche, nelle figure dei martiri che esso mette in scena, esempi di morte santa.

Il messaggio edificante si trasforma, in particolare nell'Europa riformata e nei lontani paesi di missione, in fruttuosa opera evangelizzatrice.

Giovanni Isgrò si sofferma sul Giappone, evidenziando tra l'altro come in quella terra lontana, già nel 1562, in occasione del Natale, ma anche di altre festività, si recitasse nelle chiese. Seguendo una lungimirante modalità che distingue in ogni luogo l'opera missionaria della Compagnia di Gesù, i pochi padri lì presenti non entrarono in conflitto con usi e costumi locali; di conseguenza "la forma del teatro sacro si andava dunque consolidando, amalgamandosi progressivamente con la cultura del territorio e assumendo al tempo stesso, una configurazione originale e riconoscibile", p. 203.

Il volume si configura come un'opera di sintesi, anche per questo avrebbe avuto bisogno di essere corredato da un indice dei nomi, se non dei luoghi, e da un apparato di note più sostanzioso. Manifestando una certa perplessità su quanto scrive Claudio Bernardi nella propria *Prefazione* (p. 9), siamo portati a credere che le note non avrebbero, come afferma lo scrivente, appesantito il volume, ma piuttosto lo avrebbero completato e impreziosito.

Si rilevano purtroppo alcuni errori (si vedano per esempio la n. 12, p. 24 e la n. 6, p. 64, rispettivamente per i titoli dei testi e le date di pubblicazione) e imprecisioni, nonché affermazioni tanto di peso quanto frettolose e non documentate, come quella secondo la quale alcuni drammaturghi gesuiti “scrissero grandi opere teatrali che rimasero spesso non pubblicate perché concepite ben al di fuori da logiche commerciali”, p. 18.

Talvolta la bibliografia risulta datata. Non soltanto quella generale, ma anche quella riguardante la produzione dei singoli drammaturghi, per esempio quella del già ricordato Miguel Venegas. Per conoscere e la produzione e il difficile carattere di questo autore, non si può infatti prescindere dagli scritti, ai quali non si fa riferimento, di Margarida Miranda, scritti culminati nel recente volume *Miguel Venegas and the Earliest Jesuit Theater* (2019).

Non si può dire che il libro di Giovanni Isgrò aggiunga elementi inediti a quanto conosciamo del teatro scolastico dei Gesuiti. Esso si può considerare comunque un apprezzabile contributo, il cui significato primo sta nell'aver realizzato una sintesi tra gli elementi storici, culturali, drammaturgici e quant'altro che distinguono il teatro dei Gesuiti, dandogli altresì una propria specificità e una propria importanza, mai abbastanza riconosciuta, nella storia del Teatro.

Roma

Mirella Saulini

Malyn Newitt, ed. and trans., *Journey which Father António Gomes Made to the Empire of Manomotapa* (Viagem q'Fez o Padre Antº Gomes ... ao Imperio de Manomotapa). Oxford: Oxford University Press, for The British Academy, 2021. 198pp. £ 65.00. ISBN 9780197266793.

This is a critical edition and translation into English of a text that was originally written in Portuguese by Father António Gomes in 1648. The author, a Portuguese Jesuit about whose personal life there is but scanty information, worked as a missionary in southeastern Africa and in India for a number of years. The text is an account of his experiences in Africa, complemented by material borrowed from similar accounts by others, and covering details like geography, people, culture and politics. In many instances, Gomes emphasizes the economic potential of southeastern Africa for the kingdom of Portugal. While such emphases make the text less about missionary activity and more about ordinary secular matters, Gomes clearly saw

effective Portuguese occupation of the region as a necessary step towards the evangelization of Africans.

The editor and translator is a major authority on Portuguese Africa. With this volume, as indeed with an earlier one entitled *East Africa: Portuguese Encounters with the World in the Age of the Discoveries* (Ashgate, 2002), he goes beyond producing historiography to making important original sources on Portuguese Africa accessible to English users who might otherwise not access them directly in their original, often complex, Portuguese.

The editor's introduction places the text in an appropriate context. It serves as an important aid to the present-day reader who might not be familiar with both the Jesuit background of the author and the seventeenth-century social, political, and economic environment of the region that is often referred to as "the Zambezia" or "the Rivers". The territories described in the text fall under present-day Mozambique, Zimbabwe and Malawi. Also in the introduction is the editor's own critical analysis of the text, showing, for example, where the author relied on his own experience in southeastern Africa and which parts of the manuscript owe their origins to a secondary or tertiary source. To satisfy the critical scholar, the editor discusses his editorial method, shows where his reproduction of the Portuguese original differs from earlier transcriptions, and indicates where choices were made between unclear or even controversial options. For example, the editor opted not to translate the word *cafre* with which Africans were designated, thus eschewing the use of the likely candidate *kaffir* "which," he says, "is not a term acceptable today." (xl)

Also included in the introduction are six illustrations. Among them are two maps, one current and indicating locations that appear more prominently in the narrative, and the other, a 1665 sketch of the Empire of Monomotapa by cartographer João Texeira Albenaz II. There is also a 1675 painting of the Murder of Gonçalo da Silveira, a Jesuit missionary who was killed in that region in 1561 and who is proposed in the text as a model and motivation for further Jesuit missions in southeastern Africa.

The Portuguese text, now critically edited, follows immediately after the introduction, taking up seventy-six pages of the book (pp. 1-76). Readers in Portuguese might have wrestled meaning from the original manuscript that is said to be "located in the Biblioteca Nacional de Rio de Janeiro in the section of Livros Raros," or from a transcript published in a 1959 issue of "the long defunct journal *Studia*." (xiii). However, their reading is made infinitely easier in this

critical edition, which is also relatively more accessible in its current book form.

The greater service rendered through this book is, however, the English translation. The editor mentions an earlier effort at translation, arranged by David Beach and actually done by H. de Noronha, which ended up "as a cyclostyled transcript in the library of the University of Zimbabwe," (xv) thus not significantly accessible to many. With this current translation, the editor and translator makes this "original" material available to the much broader body of students and scholars of seventeenth-century Africa with the facility of English but without Portuguese, especially seventeenth-century Portuguese and style.

The English translation forms the major part of this book, covering 108 pages (77-184). This part is considerably longer than the Portuguese one because of 369 editorial footnotes, a few of which were adopted from the transcript version in *Studia*.

Besides making Gomes's text more broadly available, this book also exposes the usefulness of the text itself. In it we come across some of the earliest descriptions of what are understood to be Lake Malawi and River Shire; we gain a glimpse of the political and economic organizations of societies in southeastern Africa; and we begin to see the impact Portuguese contacts and settlements were having on those African societies. For historians of Africa, the text makes relatively easy the important task of recovering African agency and voices from the past through European-authored documents. Many parts of the book support the editor's view that "[an] unusual, but very attractive, aspect of Gomes's narrative is the way he tries to make Africans live participants in his story." (xvii) The editor provides examples of such; however, the one that I personally found most interesting involved a rather haughty Portuguese captain who, worried that he might be delayed in his journey, grew increasingly angry and expressed his emotion by insulting the African rowers who sung as they worked at their pace. "[No] matter how much I told him during the voyage not to worry, he never paid any attention," says Gomes. At one point, completely fed up with the Africans who would not take him seriously, the captain shouted: "By the Holy Gospel, I am going to take a cutlass and split your heads"! The Africans, also fed up with him, immediately changed the lyrics of their song, now repeating the words: "Hear, Hear, Hear! Holy Gospel! Chief Captain. Pick up? Cutlass? Split Head? Holy Gospel! Hear? Hear?" They sang the song every day for the remainder of the journey, and the captain was humiliated to complete silence. (161)

This book also exposes what is complex or even unhelpful in Gomes's text. While instances like the one just described are helpful in recovering African agency, Gomes's descriptions of nearly every kind of African contractual labor as "slavery" would seem to play into the narratives that Europeans of that period used to mollify their consciences as they formulated moral arguments for the buying and selling of Africans. That "Gomes saw slavery everywhere in the creole society and in the neighboring African kingdoms" as the editor observes (xxxii) and as it becomes obvious in Gomes's own text could be because of this very inclination to seeing Africans as slaves. Equally difficult to understand are Gomes's multiple references to cannibalism. These accounts are problematic not so much because they allege the consumption of human flesh by Africans (Africans also alleged that the Portuguese were cannibals), but because several of them are graphic exaggerations that exceed the possible. Gomes would want us to believe that, "When they [Africans] are returning from some victory and have taken prisoners, if someone is hungry, he just walks up to a poor *cafre* woman and cuts off a piece of flesh from her and has it either well done or underdone, *and the poor woman walks on until she faints and falls down; there and then they make a fire and eat her up.*" (131, my emphasis) The appearance of collaboration by the mutilated woman would seem to go against the generally accepted biological instinct to survive – even from the perspective of seventeenth-century Europeans viewing Africans' place in the animal kingdom, if not in the human family. Notwithstanding recent scholarship that casts doubt on such graphic claims of rampant African cannibalism, the editor concludes that, the practice, "either of the ritual kind within warrior communities or resulting from malnutrition, almost certainly did occur." (xxxix)

Finally, besides its value as a source of information for researchers, this is also a good book for teaching purposes. As I read it, I could not stop imagining myself using Gomes's text to discuss with my students the strengths and weaknesses of the written document as a historical source, and what, even in the same document, might count as primary and secondary source. In this way, both the independent researcher and the guided student of pre-colonial African history will benefit from this book.

Alexandre Coello de la Rosa and David Atienza, eds, *Scars of Faith: Jesuit Letter from the Mariana Islands (1668-1684)*. Boston: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2020. 357pp. \$49.95. ISBN 978-1-947617-07-0.

Two well-known scholars of the Mariana Islands, historian Alexandre Coello and anthropologist David Atienza, have teamed up to produce this important scholarly edition of primary sources dating from the first phase of the Jesuit mission in this Pacific archipelago. Albeit at the margins of the Spanish Empire, the Mariana Islands were in fact central to the early modern global trade network and they also loomed large in the Jesuit imaginary as an enticing frontier of evangelization and salvific space where death for the faith was a real possibility in the late seventeenth century. The volume's rich primary sources shed light on the activities, thoughts, and motivations of the first generation of Jesuits who flocked to the shores of the Marianas in search of martyrdom. The selection stretches across the eventful period from the mission's founding by Father Diego Luis de Sanvitores in 1668, the 'first Great War of Guam', and Sanvitores's murder in April 1672 up through the years of intermittent hostilities that culminated in a last major, and ultimately unsuccessful, Chamorro uprising in 1684. Readers can peruse the documents in both the original Spanish (with a few Latin letters strewn in) and in a very effective English translation produced by Yesenia Pumarada Cruz.

Editors Coello and Atienza open the volume with a substantive and very helpful introduction that sets the stage for the primary documents at the heart of the collection. The introduction familiarizes readers with the islands and their culture as well as the history of the mission and the worldview of the Jesuits who sought their own salvation through the salvation of an island population whom the Jesuits saw in danger of being weaponized by the devil in his global fight against the forces of God. Violence towards resistant islanders and an inclination towards violent self-sacrifice followed logically from this missionary outlook according to the editors. Coello and Atienza further point to the context of global evangelization and particularly the importance of the Japanese martyrs and the closure of Japan in 1639 as an inspiration for Marianas missionaries. Although Jesuits deemed Chamorro islanders less civilized than the Japanese (and the Chinese for that matter), they came to view the archipelago as the next spiritual frontier and a crucial launching pad for the renewal of the mission in Japan.

Coello's and Atienza's introduction also discusses how martyrological discourses circulating in the post-Trent Church and within the Society of Jesus fuelled Jesuit hopes for dying in the Marianas and how family members, mission patrons, and Europe's faithful in turn could be consoled, edified, and inspired by Marianas martyr stories. Official sanctity, however, proved hard to come by for early modern Marianas missionaries. Mission founder Sanvitores alone was beatified as late as 1985 and his canonization is still pending. Coello and Atienza conclude their introduction with an intriguing argument about the reasons behind the difficulties in gaining official recognition for the Marianas 'martyrs'. In a methodological move that could fruitfully be extended to other mission territories, they propose to investigate the role of indigenous ontologies in the missionary encounter. In this specific instance, they argue that Austronesian ideas about good vs. bad death acted as an impediment to the promotion of Jesuit saints in the Marianas. Within these indigenous frameworks, the nature of death, notably violent or non-violent, determined whether the deceased was included in the ancestral lineage and destined for a blissful post-mortem space or, inversely, considered a pollutant force and relegated to a netherworld. Violent martyrdom placed Jesuits on the wrong side of the binary divide.

While this is a very compelling argument and one that already goes beyond the scope of most introductions to primary sources, it begs for further exploration still of how and why Father Sanvitores was able to slip through the cracks to be recognized and venerated as a saintly figure by Chamorros. Tumon Bay, the site of Sanvitores' killing, was long viewed as cursed, as Coello and Atienza note. Tumon Bay has also been a site of popular devotion to Sanvitores, though, and the Jesuit's 1985 beatification was the result of a Guam-driven initiative, as is the continued promotion of Sanvitores' canonization in Rome. Guam's broader Catholic Chamorro community has clearly claimed Sanvitores as its saint. A deeper dive into this seeming exception to the rule could have strengthened the editors' larger claim.

The bulk of the book consists of the historical documents framed by short introductions with information about the documents' provenance and pertinent historical contexts for understanding their content. The primary sources include an unpublished sketch of Diego Luis de Sanvitores and edifying letters about the lives and deaths of Father Luis de Medina, his coadjutor Brother Pedro

Pavón and his Filipino oblate Felipe Sonsón. The collection's true gem is a set of unpublished letters by Father Manuel de Solórzano y Escobar (1675-1685), which Coello and Atienza were able to obtain from a private collection, and an unpublished report by Solórzano, the original of which can be found in the Biblioteca del Palacio Real in Madrid. Solórzano's letters are beautifully personal in nature, opening up the inner world of an aspiring Marianas martyr and shedding light on his fears and hopes regarding the mission as well as on his complicated emotional ties with the family members whose wishes he overrode and whom he left behind. In addition, the letters contain revealing details about missionary life from a lengthy account of the challenges of transoceanic voyaging to the minutiae of daily life in the Marianas mission and various pieces of ethnographic observation. The unpublished report Solórzano wrote in his capacity as the mission's vice-provincial complements the personal letters very well, as the report, alongside accounts of the activities of the Jesuits and Spanish colonizers, offers some additional information about natural life in the islands, indigenous culture and traditions and thereby at least a glimpse into Chamorro life worlds.

The historical record for the seventeenth-century Marianas mission is notoriously one-sided, since virtually all written sources stem from the quills of European outsiders whose perspectives have therefore long dominated public memory. The primary sources presented in *Scars of Faith* are part of this Eurocentric corpus and tell first and foremost about Jesuit self-understandings and experiences in the Marianas. This does not detract, however, from the usefulness of this previously unpublished material for understanding more deeply the history of a missionary encounter marked by considerable physical and cultural violence towards the indigenous population. It is to Coello's and Atienza's credit that they marshal their combined historical and anthropological expertise to highlight Chamorro perspectives on the mission and its 'martyrs' in framing the primary source material for readers and thus create a counterweight to the Euro-centrism of the sources assembled. On the whole, this collection represents a great addition to the steadily growing body of literature on a less familiar yet fascinating Jesuit mission and on the still relatively unexplored history of the Mariana Islands under Spanish rule.

Duilio Contin and Lucia Tongiorgi Tomasi, eds, *Michał Boym*. [facsimile] *Flora Sinensis, fructus floresque humillime porrigens, serenissimo et potentissimo principi, ac domino, domino Leopoldo Ignatio ...* [vol. 1]; *Una nuova natura: il gesuita Michał Boym nella Cina del Seicento* [vol. 2]. Sansepolcro: Aboca, 2021. €150,00. ISBN 9788898881895 8898881894.

The stories of many figures that travelled to China in the seventeenth century, including Matteo Ricci, Martino Martini and other Jesuit missionaries, are well researched and documented. However, this is not always the case, as with Michel Boym, one of the Jesuit missionaries whose work – in the form of a new edition – is the subject of this review, and who warrants revisiting from the angle of natural history. He was a Polish Jesuit missionary in China and he authored numerous books on the fauna, flora and geography of Asia. Michał Boym was born in 1614 in Lemberg, Poland (now L'viv, Ukraine) to a wealthy family of Hungarian origins. In 1631, the Boym joined the Society of Jesus in Kraków and left Europe in 1643 as a missionary to China.

Boym wrote extensively about the country's botanical, zoological, medical and geographical aspects. The book under review draws attention to Michał Boym's *Flora Sinensis*, an illustrated volume of the Chinese and East Asian flora and fauna. The first part is a facsimile of *Flora Sinensis* (Vienna, 1656). For the facsimile, the editors used the copy held at the Trivulziana library, part of the Sforzesco Castle in Milan (B 809, 1656). All the copies of *Flora Sinensis* differ from each other in colouring as the etchings were hand-coloured. This copy held at the Trivulziana has beautiful vivid colours thanks to the good conditions in which the book was conserved.

The second part of the book provides in-depth essays by leading scholars who were invited to write on various aspects of Boym's endeavours. *Una nuova natura: il gesuita Michał Boym nella Cina del Seicento* is edited by Duilio Contin and Lucia Tongiorgi Tomasi, who are a long-established scholar in the interdisciplinary field where botany and art meet.

Isabella Fiorentini, who oversees the Trivulziana Library, opens the second part of the volume with an overview of Boym's work owned by the library. She starts with the history of this version of the work in the context of the library's evolution and the Trivulziana family's interest in Jesuit books. She analyses the conservation of the book, comparing it to the other copies

owned in Italy, and elsewhere and the publication of the book by the Viennese Matthäus Rickhes. She correctly observes that although these illustrations are described as woodcuts, they are etchings that can be seen through a closer investigation of the lines. Regarding the hand coloured images, it is however worth noting that, while most of the versions were coloured, the one known to have remained in black and white is at the Kew Library (Boym).

The second essay is by Francesco Surdich, who wrote about the significance of Jesuits in China in the first half of the seventeenth century. Widely published in the field of transcultural contact zones between Europe and the New World, and Europe and Asia during the Age of Exploration, and the history of cartography, Surdich writes here about Matteo Ricci, Michele Ruggieri, and the other members of the Society of Jesus who created maps of China for the European public. The main works he discusses are Athanasius Kircher's *China Illustrata* in 1667 and Martino Martini's *Novus Atlas Sinensis* and other Jesuit writings on mathematics, hydrology, botany, astronomy and the calendars.

The next essay is written by the two editors of the book, Duilio Contin, and Lucia Tongiorgi Tomasi. Their contribution focuses on the life of Michał Boym. It gives an overview of Boym's family and his first steps as a Jesuit from Poland, who like many members of the Society, was willing to go as a missionary to China. The essay begins with a short biography followed by a chapter dedicated to Boym's writings, starting with the *Litterae Indipetae*, letters the Jesuit sent to Rome requesting to be sent to the China mission. Boym's Chinese name in Pinyin is usually given as Bu Mige, while here the authors opted to use Pau Mi-ko.

Unfortunately, in parts footnotes are lacking with respect to the many facts provided as part of the commentary, an important tool for connecting this in-depth study to other publications about Boym. Nevertheless, the detailed description of another of Boym's work, "Magni Catay" (Ms Borg. Cin. 531, Vatican Library), is interesting, since it is an important work which has remained in manuscript form. More generally, the two scholars contextualize Boym's movements and his contributions to the knowledge transfer in which he was involved. For instance, the letter Boym sent to Ferdinando II de' Medici and published in 1780 by Giovanni Torgioni Tozzetti in *Notizie degli aggrandimenti delle scienze fisiche in Toscana* in sheds light on the Polish Jesuit's network and also opens further questions about the information he provided to other well-known rulers and scholars of that time. Boym's medical works

are more complex and, while it is important to include them in a discussion of his writings, his authorship has been questioned recently.¹

The two editors of the volumes also wrote the last essay in the commentary, “La [s]fortuna di Michał Boym”, which compares the Polish Jesuit to other members of the Society of Jesus. Firstly, Boym is viewed in relation to Athanasius Kircher, whose *China Monumentis* (Amsterdam, 1667) was a best seller at the time, and who, along with other Jesuit writers, heavily relied on Boym’s material when describing China’s botany and zoology.

Paolo Tongiorgi’s “Le tavole degli animali” presents an interesting comparison between two works of Michał Boym: *Flora Sinensis* and *Magni Catay* (Tongiorgi, 1966). He discusses the depictions of animals in both works, and that the images and descriptions of the animals are the first surveys of Chinese fauna available to the European audience.²

Peter Crane’s “L’opera botanica di Michał Boym” provides additional layers from the perspective of the history of botany, especially keeping in mind the transplanting processes that created an enormous change in the topography of cultivated plants. Crane’s botanical insights enlarge our understanding of how Boym’s work has been seen. He positions him within the chain of knowledge circulation at a time when plant transplantation was dramatically changing the available crops in the different continents. He concludes his study by observing that, while Boym is often criticized for having described plants that were not new to the Europeans, in fact the details and information he added were vital additions to the knowledge of the time that were later incorporated into the botanical knowledge system by others. Indeed, he argues that Boym should be studied also from the perspective of the current field of botany.

To conclude, this publication is of the utmost importance, as it moves Michał Boym away from missionary historiography towards the history of botany and natural history, where his works also should have an important place. While this large two-volume work certainly is expensive, its target audience is also limited,

1 M. Hanson and G. Pomata, “Medicinal Formulas and Experiential Knowledge in the Seventeenth-Century Epistemic Exchange between China and Europe”, *Isis* 108.1 (2017): 1–25.

2 See also E. Csillag, “Natural History Illustrations in Michał Boym’s Chinese Atlas (Borg. cin. 531) and *Flora Sinensis*”, *Studi e Testi* 541 (2020), 115–141.

since it is available only in the Italian language. Despite these shortcomings, the work's strength stands in including specialists from a number of different fields to join the project. The result is that the broad horizons provided by Lucia Tongiorgi Tomasi and Duilio Contin in this beautiful two-volume work offer new and significant perspectives in "Boymian" studies.

Hong Kong University

Eszter Csillag

Francesco Frisullo e Paolo Vincenti, *L'apostolato scientifico dei Gesuiti nella Cina dei Ming. Il missionario salentino Sabatino de Ursis* [The Jesuits' scientific apostolate in Ming China. The Salento missionary Sabatino de Ursis]. Lecce: Giorgiani Editore, 2020. 288pp. €20,00. ISBN 9788894969207.

The study of the Jesuit missions across the world integrates global and local perspectives and requires scholars to engage with a number of specific disciplines and their various branches, such as history, philosophy, theology, translation studies, linguistics. Over the past few decades, experts from different cultural and academic backgrounds have often come together to offer fresh insights into the Jesuits' missionary and literary activities worldwide, showcasing an increasingly transnational and multidisciplinary approach.

Francesco Frisullo and Paolo Vincenti's study is most definitely a product of this scholarly trend. As the title suggests Sabatino de Ursis' (1575 – 1620) biography and missionary endeavours don't act only as *trait d'union* across the 18 chapters of the book, but also serve as tools to analyse the global geopolitical context in which the Jesuits operated. This intention is immediately evident in the first chapter, which provides a well-documented examination of how the Society of Jesus fit into the age of geographical exploration and the Portuguese crown's sphere of influence, as well as the earliest activities and reports of Westerners in China, from the Papal legates of the Yuan period (1279 – 1378) to the Portuguese settlements during the Ming dynasty (1368 – 1644). Chapters two and three reconstruct de Ursis' early life (beginning in Ruffano, a town in Lecce province) through a meticulous and comprehensive archival investigation. Young de Ursis almost comes to life as he is introduced as a novice of the Society of Jesus, which he joined in 1597 "despite his fragile health", and later as a student in Naples and

Rome. In tracking the early stages of the Jesuit's life and formation, the two authors successfully highlight the discrepancies between the different sources while offering a plausible reconstruction of de Ursis' network of teachers and fellow students, his devotion to the "cose di matematica" (things pertaining to mathematics) and an account of his departure from Lisbon to China in 1602. As a matter of fact, it was his competence in mathematics (and architecture) that provided de Ursis a one-way ticket to the Beijing residence in 1607, where he had the opportunity to assist his eminent confrère Matteo Ricci (1552 – 1610) in introducing notions of European *scientia* (particularly mathematics, geometry and astronomy) to the late Ming literati.

The main body of Frisullo and Vincenti's investigation pertains to de Ursis' activity in China, from his residence at St. Paul's College Macau (1603 – 1606), to his death in the aftermath of the Nanjing persecution (or *Nanjing jiao'an* 南京教案, "Nanjing missionary incident", as it is usually referred to in Chinese sources) in 1620. While generally following a chronological order, many chapters also offer informative digressions on topics such as the dissemination of Western mathematics in China and the role of the subject in Chinese tradition (pp. 39 – 55), the Jesuit presence in Macau (pp. 65 – 75), the history of the China mission (pp. 75 – 80), their accommodation policy (pp. 81 – 95), the relation between the Society of Jesus and Galileo Galilei (1564–1642), and more. Although not always entirely accurate, these digressions demonstrate the authors' commitment to a comprehensive study based on Western and Chinese sources, while providing non-specialists with a helpful reconstruction of the historical and cultural background in which de Ursis was immersed. Great prominence is also given to the Jesuit's literary productions, from his *Relação da morte do Padre Matteus Ricio* (1611), which provided the basis for Nicolas Trigault's (1577 – 1628) famous *De Christiana Expeditione apud Sinas* (1616, pp. 99 – 100), to his astronomical works (particularly *Biao du shuo* 表度說, "Explanation of the gnomon", 1614, pp. 137 – 146), the treatise on hydraulics (*Taixi shuifa* 泰西水法 "Hydromethods of the Great West", 1612, pp. 163 – 181) or the now lost *De cognitione veri Dei apud Literatos* (p. 187), to name but a few. These works are not just a testament to de Ursis' all-encompassing knowledge and of his profound understanding of the Chinese cultural tradition, but they are also used by the authors to present the Jesuit's contribution to the so-called "term controversy" (pp. 187 – 205) and technical and scientific exchanges with educated officials.

As Sabatino de Ursis' only complete biography, this book is most certainly a welcome addition to the field of history pertaining to the Jesuit mission in China. The authors' joint effort results in a respectable tribute to the 400th anniversary of the Jesuit's death by offering fresh insights into his life, talents, personal relations and literary achievements. It would undoubtedly be beneficial to translate this study into English to make the authors' familiarity with multi-language sources available to a broader readership. Nevertheless, when undertaking such commitment, a more rigorous editing would be advisable, in order to rid this work of stylistic inconsistencies (such as the alternate use of the pinyin and Wade – Giles systems and of characters alongside Chinese terms and minor typos in the transcription of Chinese names, etc.) to make it even a more enjoyable read.

University of Oxford

Giulia Falato

Litian Swen, *Jesuit Mission and Submission. Qing Rulership and the Fate of Christianity in China, 1644–1735*. Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2021. 227pp. €39.00/\$47.00. ISBN 978-90-04-44700-4.

Litian Swen's book proposes a reexamination of the Jesuits' identity and status at the Qing court under the emperors Shunzhi 順治 (r.1644–1661), Kangxi 康熙 (r. 1661–1722) and Yongzheng 雍正 (r. 1723–1735). It is based on his doctoral dissertation submitted to the Department of History, City University of New York, in 2019.

Through a remarkable study of aptly-selected archival sources, Swen makes a convincing case that the rise and fall of the Jesuit mission in China was deeply intertwined with the missionaries' relationship with the first three emperors, particularly with Kangxi, who regarded them as "household slaves (*booi aha*)". Such a title made the Jesuits a part of Kangxi's inner circle, granting them direct access to (and possibly the trust of) the emperor, something that even the founder of the China mission, Matteo Ricci (1552–1610) had not attained. Unlike late-Ming Jesuits, household slaves did not respond to the Ministry of Rites, but were "managed by the Imperial Household Department and were under the direct protection of the emperors (p.9)". It is in the light of the Manchu master-slave paradigm that Swen reassesses the roles and reputations of the Jesuit missionaries at court, with a particular focus on their involvement in

crucial events, which endangered and eventually compromised the survival of the mission.

After setting the framework, which reconsiders the conventional understanding of the concepts of the Jesuits' identity, the master-slave relationship, and cultural paradigms within the Qing court, Swen's argument unfolds across three parts: Part One "The Jesuits' Identity and Qing Rulership (1644–1705)" (pp. 25–108); Part Two "Emperor Kangxi's Negotiations with the Pope 1705–1721" (pp. 109–168); and Part Three "The Prohibition in 1724" (pp. 169–195). The first part traces the main stages of the establishment and consolidation of the relationship between the Jesuits and the first two Manchu emperors. This path is exemplified by the memorials of Ludovico Buglio (1606–1682) and Gabriel de Magalhaens (1609–1677) that were submitted to Shunzhi, in which they explain how they went from being captives of the rioters in Sichuan, where they had been preaching since the final years of the Ming dynasty, to being "released and brought to Beijing" by the Qing army, where they were nourished and protected by the "Board of Rites, the Imperial Kitchen and the Tong clan" (to which Kangxi's mother belonged) (p.25). In his analysis, Swen presents the Ming–Qing transition as an opportunity that the Jesuits seized to reshape their identity as missionaries and court officials, all the while expanding their network to include prominent Manchu families and individuals via their knowledge and technical expertise.

This complex system of ties did not prevent the Jesuits from being involved in court conflicts, with the most prominent example being the infamous calendar case in 1664 (pp. 50–62). The case resulted in the arrest of the then Director of the Imperial Astronomic Bureau, Adam Schall von Bell (1591–1666), some of his Chinese subordinates, and all of the other missionaries in Beijing. While investigating the reasons that led to Yang Guangxian's 楊光先 (1597–1669) accusations, which costed a respected individual such as Schall his reputation (and nearly his life), Swen makes a number of valid points and presents the calendar case not just as a cultural clash, but as a "complex case of court politics" (p.70). Yang, who represented an anti-Christian intellectual trend at court, targeted the Jesuit for "his role as minister, not as missionary" (p.72), but he is also depicted as a quarrelsome individual who didn't enjoy great popularity among his contemporaries, partly because he had failed the imperial examination (pp. 61–62). The calendar case is used by Swen to provide a glimpse into the complex threefold cultural relationship that existed at the Manchu court, but also to provide a more comprehensive picture of the Jesuits' network of supporting

officials, who don't always receive the same scholarly attention as those who opposed them.

The focus of Part Two is the widely-known Rites Controversy from the perspective of the emperor Kangxi. In particular, the author explores how the two Papal legations were perceived by the Qing sovereign in light of his close connections with the Jesuits. Swen argues that Kangxi did not consider his first audience with Charles-Thomas Maillard de Tournon (1668–1710) to be a “diplomatic meeting, but a personal meeting with a religious individual” (p. 113) who belonged to his *boois'* family. It was only at a later stage that the emperor realised the ultimate purpose of these visits and began questioning the management of the China mission, thus introducing the *piao* 票 as a way to “bring the mission back as it used to be (with Ricci)” (p. 134). Swen makes a strong case by demonstrating how Kangxi, whose family had protected the Jesuits since the establishment of the Qing dynasty and who had been educated in Western subjects by Ferdinand Verbiest (1623–1688) alongside some of his confreres, stood by the missionaries for the entire duration of the negotiations with the Pope. The author goes as far as to suggest that Kangxi was actually dragged into the Controversy by the Jesuits, “as a way to gain more leverage with the Pope”, something that seems to be omitted in the *Acta Pekinensia* (pp. 125–127). In Swen's opinion, Kangxi's behaviour throughout the Rites Controversy is not only justified by the master-slave relationship or by mere political strategy (the missionaries' technical expertise made them greatly valuable to the court), but also reflects the sovereign's outstanding negotiation skills (as seen in the exchange with Cardinal Carlo Ambrogio Mezzabarba, the second legate, p. 160). In his conclusions, Swen convincingly explains why the second delegation was not a failure and why the Rites Controversy should not be entirely blamed for the prohibition of the Christian faith (pp. 164–168).

Part Three brings Swen's examination to a close, by exploring Yongzheng's prohibition in 1724. This came about as a result of a series of unpredictable events, namely changes on the local and international stages, a local accident involving a missionary, the emperor's deep Buddhist faith, and the Jesuits' misguided expectations of Kangxi's successor, which made them keep their distance from Yongzheng in the same way they did with Buddhist monks (p.190). Swen shows how Yongzheng never gave a personal reason for the ban of Christianity (he blamed an accident in Fujian and reacted to protect the stability of the empire), but indicates

that the Jesuits' misplaced loyalty in his political opponents and involvement in court policies might have eventually influenced the future of the mission.

In conclusion, the book provides an alternative interpretation of conventional historical research questions pertaining to the failure of the Jesuit mission to China. Swen proposes to identify a continuum between the experience of the late-Ming/early-Qing missionaries, those who survived at the Qing court after the prohibition, and the post-1850 preachers who had the opportunity to build on the work done by their predecessor. Swen's persistent focus on individuals (particularly emperors Kangxi and Yongzheng) and their family network also serves to explain how occurrences that elude historical patterns such as coincidences, personal choices, and unpredictable events can all contribute to shape history. It is in this light that Swen recommends historians to reassess the rise and fall of the Jesuit mission to China so as to provide a fresh perspective on a narrative otherwise focused on its inevitable failure. Such an original and well-documented argument, alongside the author's meticulous analysis of the sources, are only two of the elements that make Swen's study a valuable and welcome contribution to the field.

University of Oxford

Giulia Falato

Giulia Falato, *Alfonso Vagnone's Tongyou jiaoyu (On the Education of Children, c. 1632)*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill. 308pp. \$119.00. ISBN 9789004430501.

This volume by Giulia Falato is the result of her doctoral research in Civilization of Asia and Africa (University of Rome Sapienza, 2017). This work examines the text *Tongyou jiaoyu* ("On the Education of Children"), compiled in Chinese by the Italian Jesuit Alfonso Vagnone (Turin, 1568–Jiangzhou, 1640) in the 20s–30s of the XVII century.

In the *Acknowledgments* and the *Introduction*, Giulia Falato declares the purpose of her book: an attempt to disclose one of the many stories of "Sino-Western inclusiveness and peaceful cohabitation" (p. VII) in the frame of the encounter between European missionaries and the Chinese elite in Ming-Qing China. The book aims to show the crucial role of Alfonso Vagnone's work in creating a bridge between the pedagogical traditions of China

and Europe. On the basis of a comparative analysis of the historical-cultural background, Giulia Falato examines the peculiar effort of accommodation, adaptation, and integration between *Xixue* ("Western Wisdom") and *Dongxue* ("Eastern Wisdom") made by Vagnone in *Tongyou jiaoyu* through his excellent linguistic and philosophical skills and the effective use of rhetoric.

Giulia Falato's book is divided into two parts. The first part (pp. 1–133) is composed of five chapters, respectively focused on the following aspects: eliciting the historical-cultural framework regarding Vagnone's pedagogical training (Chap. 1) and to the Chinese tradition (Chap. 2); tracing the phases of development of the *Tongyou jiaoyu* (Chap. 3); identifying the possible European and Chinese sources (Chap. 4); analysing the language and style of Vagnone's text (Chap. 5). The second part (pp. 134–281) consists of an annotated English translation of the entire text, which is followed by a brief concluding paragraph (pp. 282–284), a bibliography of primary and secondary sources (pp. 284–291), and a detailed analytical index (pp. 292–298).

The first chapter (pp. 1–22) deals with the peculiar pedagogical approach of the Jesuits, as expressed in the *Ratio Studiorum*, and highlights how it comprised both medieval features and innovative elements borrowed from Renaissance education. The biographical and intellectual profile of Vagnone is then outlined, recalling the phases of his academic formation, and emphasizing his academic success in general, and his particular gift in the *Ars Rhetorica*.

The second chapter (pp. 23–49) discusses the importance of pedagogy in the Chinese philosophical tradition. It begins by clarifying the origin of pedagogical studies within Confucianism and neo-Confucianism, and stresses the importance of the philosopher Zhu Xi (1130–1200) and the pedagogical approach codified by him in a *curriculum studiorum* based on the gradual study of the classics, which remained in use until the late Ming dynasty (p.30); in the second part of the chapter, Falato explains how, during the Ming-Qing period, a debate on educational issues flared up (p. 45), and how critical positions towards the Confucian tradition emerged, with the philosopher Wang Yangming (1472–1529) being the promoter of a new pedagogical conception which considered knowledge as inherent in the mind, and advocated for the use of intuition rather than self-cultivation through study.

In the third chapter (pp. 50–65) the stages of the long process of conceiving, compiling and finalizing the *Tongyou jiaoyu* are traced.

The author first investigates the complex reasons that sparked the interest of Vagnone in pedagogy, explaining this both in terms of his immersion into Renaissance culture, and his embodiment of humanist fervour (p. 53), and – more specifically – in his adherence to the Jesuit strategy of setting up study programs that would serve as preparation for religious studies, along with the Jesuit project to open elementary schools throughout all China (p. 55). The second paragraph discusses the phases through which the work came to life: Vagnone could have first conceived the idea of the text back in 1615, while he was in Tianjin; eventually, he probably started to draft the text during the years of his exile in Macao (1618–1624); finally, as for the date of publication of the work, Falato takes into account both internal clues (mainly lexical) and external clues (network of personalities involved), to set *ante quem* and *post quem* terms, pointing to a date around 1630. She eventually defines the typology of Vagnone's work as a hybrid between the Jesuit religious literature for moral-edifying purposes and the "sapiential literature" typical of the Renaissance (p. 61). A brief description of the structure and the division of the *Tongyou jiaoyu* concludes the chapter.

The fourth chapter (pp. 66–93) summarizes an articulate exegesis made on Vagnone's work, reconstructing its sources, and concluding the syncretic nature of *Tongyou jiaoyu* as a "unique combination of classical, Renaissance and Chinese philosophical concepts" (p. 63). For the classical influence, Falato identifies treatises on education by Plutarch and Quintilian as the primary models for Vagnone's work, which mirrors their setting and structure. Moreover, Giulia Falato investigates the inspiration offered to Vagnone by some Renaissance sources, considering the works of Jesuit authors such as Juan Bonifacio, Maffeo Vegio, and Juan De Torres, but also accounting for the influence exerted by non-Jesuit authors – even critical of the ecclesiastical hierarchy – such as Erasmus of Rotterdam. The last part of the chapter deals with the Chinese sources which provided Vagnone and his Chinese collaborators with a neo-Confucian nuance, in terms of rhetorical style, which resulted in the most suitable to culturally translate the concepts expressed in the work; Vagnone, just like other Jesuits did before him in their Chinese works, largely used neo-Confucian lexicon and wisely quoted the classics, in order to demonstrate his "cultural awareness" to his readers.

The fifth chapter (pp. 95–133) concludes the first part of the book and, at the same time, serves perfectly as a reading guide

for the annotated translation which follows. In fact, in this chapter Giulia Falato examines the rhetorical strategies used by Vagnone in the *Tongyou jiaoyu*, such as the use of short anecdotes (*chreiai*) in dialogic or narrative (or mixed) form, and of maxims and quotations (*gnomai*), aimed at facilitating the memorization of the contents and increasing the communicative effectiveness. The chapter continues with an interesting lexical analysis focused on the neologisms present in Vagnone's text. The Turinese Jesuit, as Falato observes, makes a thoughtful use of semantic loans to express concepts which were alien to the Chinese culture, some of which are listed in Table 4 (pp. 121–122), reserving phonetic loans mainly for Western anthroponyms or toponyms (Table 2, p. 107) and, to a lesser extent, to provide the original pronunciation of concepts beside their semantic loans (Table 3, p. 119). The above-mentioned comparative tables show differences and similarities with other translation choices in the Chinese works by other Jesuits (e.g., Giulio Aleni). The last two paragraphs of the chapter are dedicated to the translations of the names of God in Chinese (pp. 123–126) and of other religious and pedagogical terms which well exemplify the linguistic expression of the accommodation strategy pursued by the Jesuits: Chinese terms, already existing in the local philosophical-religious traditions, used with an extended or shifted meaning to express concepts of Western classical philosophy or Christian theology (p. 127).

The second part of the book consists in an annotated English translation which is certainly the beating heart of the work, and it certainly succeeds in making Vagnone's work available both to the expert and non-expert readers, providing a critical apparatus with explanatory notes and, where possible, also the indication of Vagnone's sources and the justification for the translation choices are given. The English translation conducted by Falato is based on the manuscript version of the *Tongyou jiaoyu* preserved in Zikawei's library in Shanghai, which she consulted in anastatic edition (CCT Zikawei, ed. by Standaert, Dudink & Huang, 1996). The translator states (p. 135) that she added the punctuation on the basis of the printed edition preserved in the National Library of Paris (BnF, Chinois 3389); however, the punctuation in Falato's edition is far more articulated than the one in BnF copy, comprising commas, full-stops, colon, question and exclamation marks, etc., and thus showing an even more incisive intervention of the editor/translator who, perhaps, consulted also other modern editions of Vagnone's work, in addition to the edition by Thierry Meynard

and Tan Jie (2017) *Tongyou jiaoyu jinzhushu* 童幼教育今注 ("Modern Paraphrase of the *Tongyou jiaoyu*"), credited by Falato as a source (p. 8).

The text is very well edited and there are very few instances of oversights or omissions. For example, it should be noted that the date of death of Maffeo Vegio is indicated first as 1468 (p. 68) and eventually as 1458 (p. 82 note 65), while for Juan De Torres the dates of birth and death are not indicated. The latter, often quoted in the book and correctly indexed, has an almost homonym in the text, i.e. Cosme De Torres (p. 80), who does not appear in the analytical index. Apart from such minor details, no other relevant imprecisions can be found in the book.

As for the central chapters of the book, namely chapters 3 and 4, which deal with the genesis and the sources of the *Tongyou jiaoyu*, the reader could have expected a deeper insight into the role of the Chinese collaborators of Vagnone and the network of Chinese Literati and faithful who contribute to the success of his (and of other Jesuits') literary activity. Besides, with regards to Vagnone's formation as a Jesuit and as a missionary in China, and as a means to broadening the picture of the sources that constituted his pedagogical framework, it also would be interesting to investigate whether – and to what extent – Vagnone contributed to the conception and drafting of the so-called *Ratio China*, that is, the curriculum for the Jesuits of the Chinese missions, which was prepared and codified in China between 1622 and 1624 under the direction of Manuel Dias senior (1559–1639), who consulted all the confreres resident in China at the time, including Vagnone himself (cf. Brockey, M., *Journey to the East*, Harvard UP, 2007, pp. 256–257).

This volume by Giulia Falato is admirable in terms of clarity, structure, extension, and precision, and it definitely succeeds in highlighting Alfonso Vagnone's contribution to the history of the transmission of ideas and cultural relations between China and Europe. Moreover, this valuable work will hopefully pave the way to further stylistic, lexical, structural, and exegetical analysis of the other works by Vagnone, who was a very prolific author of Chinese works, many of which were written in the same period as *Tongyou jiaoyu*.

Maximiliano von Thüngen, *Ruinas jesuíticas, Paisajes de la Memoria. El patrimonio cultural de los Antigos Pueblos de Guaraníes*. Buenos Aires: SB, 2021. 152pp. ISBN 978-987-8384-28-3.

Il libro è frutto di una ricerca iniziata nel 2016 da un viaggio dell'autore, Maximiliano von Thüngen (Università di Colonia) presso le riduzioni di San Cosme y San Damián, Trinidad e Jesus, in Paraguay. Esse fanno parte dei *Trinta Pueblos*, o riduzioni gesuitiche nei territori guaraní, iniziativa che coinvolse i missionari della Compagnia di Gesù e indios, principalmente dell'etnia guaraní, dagli inizi del XVI secolo fino a metà del XVIII. Si trattava della costruzione di ampi nuclei urbani nell'ambito del dominio coloniale spagnolo, ma autonomi rispetto alla colonia dal momento che godevano di uno speciale privilegio reale. In essi vivevano da mille a sette mila indigeni con la presenza di due fino a quattro missionari gesuiti. Le riduzioni godevano di una giurisdizione peculiare perché i loro abitanti erano considerati vassalli del re di Spagna, sotto il governo di un cacicco e di un *cabildo* con un sistema economico strutturato e una vivace vita artistica e culturale. Tale impresa si estese su un ampio territorio che oggi comprende oltre al Paraguay, parte dell'Argentina, del Sud del Brasile e della Bolivia. La loro vitalità durò fino alla violenta estinzione da parte degli eserciti portoghese e spagnolo a seguito delle "guerre guaraní" promosse dagli indios, i quali non vollero sottomettersi agli effetti del Trattato di Madri (1750). Questo trattato obbligava gli indios a una trasmigrazione nello spazio della Colonia di Sacramento (nell'attuale Uruguay), privandoli dei loro territori coltivati e molto produttivi, in favore di una estensione dei confini della colonia portoghese che li avrebbe occupati (estensione di cui si beneficiò l'attuale territorio del Brasile). Come è noto, tale processo coincise anche con l'espulsione dei gesuiti e con la successiva soppressione della stessa Compagnia di Gesù.

L'obiettivo dell'autore del libro è capire come siano cambiati usi e significati delle missioni gesuitiche del Paraguay dal punto di vista dell'immaginario delle popolazioni che oggi abitano quei territori, dopo che a partire dagli anni Settanta del secolo scorso si è iniziato ad attribuire loro il valore di patrimonio culturale nazionale e mondiale. La struttura del testo parte quindi da alcune domande: quali conseguenze ha avuto una simile decisione sulla vita quotidiana delle persone che vivono nella regione e conservano tale patrimonio? E quali sono stati gli interessi delle diverse istanze che ne promossero e strutturarono il restauro (gesuiti, Stato del Paraguay, Chiesa Cattolica tedesca attraverso la Fondazione *Paracuaria* e attraverso il vescovato

dell'attuale diocesi di Encarnación)? Nel cercare risposta a questi interrogativi, l'autore ricostruisce il percorso del processo di restauro del patrimonio di quattro riduzioni dal 1973 fino al 1993, quando tale patrimonio venne dichiarato dall'Unesco, patrimonio mondiale.

L'opera si struttura in sei capitoli. Il primo capitolo ripercorre la storia delle riduzioni gesuitiche, l'origine del patrimonio monumentale, nell'ambito delle missioni ultramarine della Compagnia di Gesù. L'autore parte dall'origine del termine riduzione, che nasce dalla decisione di concentrare (dal latino *reductio ad unum*) gli indigeni in nuclei urbani, a partire dall'idea che solo in simili contesti fosse possibile proporre una vita cristiana e 'civilizzata'. Mette poi in luce gli aspetti di novità del progetto, in particolare l'abolizione del sistema lavorativo della *encomienda* che obbligava i nativi al servizio dei coloni spagnoli, beneficio questo che favorì l'adesione dei guaraní alla proposta. Passa poi a descrivere il modello di produzione e di commercio di prodotti come il cotone e l'erba mate, la struttura urbana pianificata nei dettagli dai missionari e realizzata attraverso l'adattamento alla cultura guaraní di modelli architettonici e urbanistici europei. Spazio viene dedicato anche alle arti che si svilupparono in questi ambiti attraverso l'organizzazione delle officine di scultura, pittura, architettura, musica. Poi si procede con la narrazione delle vicende che si susseguirono a partire dall'espulsione della Compagnia da quei territori nel 1767, a seguito della firma del Trattato di Madrid, che ridisegnava i confini tra le due potenze coloniali. La resistenza armata dell'esercito guaraní fu presto schiacciata dando luogo a decadenza, esodo e distruzione. Thüngen racconta il processo di dispersione dei guaraní e il destino delle aree delle riduzioni, evidenziando che si trattò di destini diversi: in San Cosme y Damian e in alcune riduzioni, la chiesa e alcuni edifici continuarono ad essere utilizzati, ma in altre, la distruzione fu progressiva dal XVIII secolo fino agli inizi del XX. Tale distruzione significò anche la dispersione del patrimonio artistico che si conservava (sculture, bassorilievi, pitture e statue). Al termine degli anni Trenta, Argentina e Brasile presero i primi provvedimenti per impedire che quel che restava delle missioni gesuitiche fosse totalmente distrutto. In Paraguay, l'iniziativa statale per la conservazione e il restauro delle riduzioni presenti sul territorio nazionale cominciò più tardi (1972). A questo fine, l'architetto venezuelano Gaetano Gasparini fu incaricato di fare un progetto a partire da una prima diagnosi esaustiva della situazione. In sintonia con la Carta di Venezia (1964), Gasparini intendeva il restauro non come ricostruzione degli edifici ma come intervento per preservarne lo stato, mantenendo intatto il carattere originario del monumento.

Nello stesso tempo, considerava una minaccia al patrimonio tutte le attività che le popolazioni locali praticavano nei terreni e negli edifici storici. Nel 1983, i siti archeologici dei *Trenta Popoli* vennero dichiarati patrimonio mondiale dell'umanità

Il secondo capitolo affronta la storia della Fondazione *Paracuaria* dal 1977 al 1982, ad opera del filantropo tedesco Paul Frings e del gesuita Josef Ubelmesser. La fondazione fu concepita per collaborare alla preservazione del patrimonio storico gesuitico guaraní del Paraguay e dei suoi valori religiosi e culturali. Era partecipe dell'iniziativa la diocesi di Encarnación dove sono ubicate le riduzioni. Thüngen sottolinea che sebbene i progetti di *Paraquaria* e di Gasparini esprimessero una comune tendenza internazionale mirata a rigenerare e proteggere il patrimonio storico, differivano molto però in quanto a concezione. Gasparini aveva un approccio tecnico, mentre la Fondazione intendeva promuovere lo sviluppo delle popolazioni circostanti, in una prospettiva culturale, cristiana, educativa e turistica. Altri elementi del processo menzionati dall'autore sono: l'influenza del pensiero del Concilio Vaticano II al riguardo dell'America Latina, soprattutto la valorizzazione della cultura religiosa popolare delle comunità di base diffuse nel territorio e la presenza dei gesuiti, tra cui quelli legati alla Teologia della Liberazione presso le comunità rurali del Paraguay, le cui denunce di genocidi e violenze ne provocò la persecuzione politica e l'esilio. Tra gli anni Settanta e Ottanta ebbero inizio i progetti di restauro del patrimonio gesuitico. In Trinidad, a partire dal 1976, fu realizzato il restauro delle statue lignee che integrarono poi il museo e nel 1978, il restauro della sacrestia. L'autore osserva che il metodo di lavoro venne criticato da vari specialisti, tra cui R. Gutierrez, perché non era fondato su basi scientifiche. Ancora una volta, la polemica contrapponeva due diverse concezioni di patrimonio storico: il sito archeologico si doveva preservare intatto, mantenendo le sue caratteristiche originarie o il restauro doveva essere orientato alle esigenze dello sviluppo culturale e sociale delle popolazioni locali? Il valore del patrimonio gesuitico guaraní divenne sempre più legato allo sviluppo turistico, ma, secondo l'autore, le comunità che erano in contatto quotidiano con questo patrimonio in piccola percentuale partecipavano alla gestione pur lavorando come impiegati (guide, giardinieri, pulizia, guardie).

Il terzo capitolo del libro si occupa del restauro di San Cosme y San Damián avvenuto tra il 1989 e 2001 e ricostruisce anche le discussioni e le polemiche sorte in merito ai metodi di lavoro attuati. La riduzione pur in decadenza, non fu mai totalmente abbandonata dalla popolazione che ne usava il tempio e vari edifici, impedendone così il

totale deterioramento. La sua storia, quindi, è un po' diversa rispetto a quella del restante patrimonio monumentale dei *Trenta Popoli*. Disastri naturali e eventi causati dall'incuria umana ne accelerarono sicuramente il processo di decadimento, ma ciò nonostante, fino alla metà del Ventesimo secolo, la riduzione conservava forma e tratti originari. Nel 1978 una donazione della fondazione tedesca *Adveniat* rese possibile il restauro della chiesa. Ma anche tale operazione diede adito a polemiche. Nuovamente si fronteggiavano due posizioni: considerare il patrimonio storico come bene culturale o come bene ad uso dalla popolazione locale e bisognoso di restauro. Quest'ultima fu la posizione prevalente e, proprio per questo motivo, il sito non venne considerato patrimonio dell'Unesco nel 1993, giacché come osserva l'autore, all'epoca l'Unesco e gli altri organi competenti alla conservazione del patrimonio reputavano che il patrimonio doveva essere restaurato preservandone il valore architettonico e storico del monumento. Venne dichiarato patrimonio monumentale dall'Unesco solo nel 2015 quando si assistette ad un cambio di prospettiva con la convenzione del 2003 dove si introdusse la nozione di patrimonio culturale immateriale e il valore attribuito all'uso quotidiano da parte delle comunità locali.

Nel quarto capitolo, si discute sulle trasformazioni della rivitalizzazione nell'immaginario delle popolazioni locali e sui processi di apprendimento del valore storico e architettonico del patrimonio. Qui l'autore rileva alcuni aspetti complessi e conflittuali che sarebbero da approfondire: per esempio, benché gli usi quotidiani e religiosi del patrimonio restino prevalenti, le popolazioni locali percepirebbero le azioni di rivitalizzazione come esterne, quasi uno spettacolo per turisti. Secondo noi, questo aspetto meriterebbe maggior approfondimento, soprattutto attraverso lo studio delle narrative dei membri delle comunità coinvolte.

Il quinto capitolo tratta della valorizzazione e restauro del patrimonio come fonte di reddito e promessa lavorativa per le popolazioni locali che stanno vivendo una fase critica dell'economia del loro territorio, a causa della distruzione del sistema agricolo tradizionale e delle forme di cultura e socialità ad esso aggregate, e anche per colpa dell'invasione delle mono culture dell'agrobusiness, come la soia. La situazione è aggravata poi dai cambiamenti ambientali basti pensare alla costruzione della grande centrale idroelettrica di Yacyretá sul fiume Paraná (1983). 110.000 ettari circa di terre produttive, varie isole del fiume e i resti della antica riduzione di Encarnación (1615) sono stati sommersi. Il fiume, tradizionalmente luogo di pesca e navigazione, divenne un immenso specchio d'acqua di più di 10

chilometri di larghezza, con drammatiche conseguenze ambientali e sociali. Grande è stato il trauma collettivo. Un intero sistema di vita e un patrimonio naturale, storico, culturale vennero sommersi. Perdute le vestigia della propria storia e i mezzi di sostentamento, alla popolazione rimase solamente la prospettiva del turismo. L'autore osserva che le stesse comunità dei guaraní mbya che vivono nella regione divennero parte del circuito turistico, un male necessario, ma non un'esperienza autentica di dialogo e scambio culturale.

Il sesto capitolo è dedicato alla rappresentazione che le popolazioni locali attuali fanno del loro passato, in particolare alla storia del periodo delle missioni gesuitiche nelle riduzioni, esprimendo memorie e giudizi al riguardo di essa, a volte conflittuali. Le guide turistiche locali, per esempio, la interpretano come un paradiso per i nativi, oppure come un esempio di violenza. Una pista interessante per ulteriori indagini è suggerita dall'autore e riguarda l'attaccamento e la venerazione manifestate dalle comunità per le immagini devozionali di origine missionaria-guaranítica, da loro gelosamente custodite. Tali immagini popolano le chiese e intervengono nel culto popolare. Secondo l'autore un fattore decisivo per spiegare questo fenomeno potrebbe essere il fatto che "rappresentano presso gli immaginari locali le ultime vestigia di un ordine sociale sparito, un passato di abbondanza strutturato intorno a valori come la solidarietà e la distribuzione equa di alimenti e ricchezze". Le leggende sull'oro o sul tesoro nascosto simbolizzano la coscienza di un patrimonio perduto, un mondo dove non c'era disuguaglianza sociale e dove vigeva un rapporto armonico con l'ambiente naturale e umano.

Le conclusioni del libro riprendono i temi della presenza delle differenti concezioni di patrimonio emergenti dallo studio delle quattro riduzioni e dell'apprendimento del valore storico culturale di tali siti archeologici presso le popolazioni locali. L'autore afferma che esse percepiscono questi luoghi come parte della propria storia, una storia non studiata a scuola, ma trasmessa attraverso la cultura orale delle famiglie. La permanenza nel loro immaginario di tali valori è simboleggiata dall'immagine con cui si chiude il libro: la grande campana dorata di Jesus che all'avvicinarsi delle truppe recanti l'ordine di espulsione dei missionari, i guaraní tolsero dal campanile e trasportarono nella laguna dove l'affondarono. Nessuno più riuscì a vederla, ma essa continua a vivere sott'acqua.

Il testo è senza dubbio di grande ricchezza e interesse, ma con la lettura emergono due questioni che vorremmo proporre in questa parte conclusiva.

La prima è che, per comprendere in modo adeguato la questione

del patrimonio culturale delle missioni gesuitico guaranì sarebbe necessaria un'analisi di insieme, non limitata alle quattro riduzioni oggetto del libro, ma estesa a tutti i restanti siti archeologici che fecero parte dei *Trenta Popoli* e che si trovano localizzati in diversi paesi latino-americani: Brasile, Argentina, Bolivia e in parte Uruguay. I *Trenta Popoli* erano una realtà unitaria connessa da una fitta rete di comunicazioni e scambi commerciali e culturali. È vero che con l'avvento degli Stati Nazionali, dopo la fine del dominio coloniale, ogni paese coinvolto fece un cammino autonomo in merito alla conservazione di questi siti, ma non si deve dimenticare che gli attori coinvolti (gesuiti e popolazioni guaranì) furono in grande parte gli stessi, come pure il progetto che sottendeva alle riduzioni. Non esistevano le attuali divisioni nazionali, si trattava di un unico territorio. Sarebbe quindi molto importante poter fare un lavoro comparativo sui processi di conservazione e significazione di tale patrimonio nei diversi paesi coinvolti.

Un secondo aspetto riguarda la necessità di discutere il concetto di patrimonio culturale anche alla luce della storiografia contemporanea. Particolarmente, riteniamo imprescindibile il contributo di F. Hartog.¹ Infatti, Thüngen afferma che la nozione di patrimonio culturale sarebbe rimasta "per molto tempo estranea all'ambito di queste popolazioni" (p. 15, trad. nostra). Tale giudizio ci sembra dipeso dai concetti di patrimonio culturale proposti nel libro e che hanno dettato le politiche di restauro e conservazione delle riduzioni analizzate. Tuttavia, se teniamo presente la nozione di regime di storicità (o senso della temporalità) proposta da Hartog, verifichiamo che memoria e patrimonio sono parole da declinarsi conforme alle diverse forme di vivere l'ordine del tempo. A seconda che questo ordine sia centrato nella dimensione del presente, o del futuro, o del passato, il patrimonio assume valori differenti. Quindi è possibile che la coscienza di patrimonio culturale esista nelle comunità considerate, ma in forme diverse da quelle descritte nel libro. Bisogna infatti distinguere tra patrimonio culturale e moderno processo di patrimonializzazione. Secondo Hartog, quest'ultimo si è esteso a partire dagli anni Ottanta e riflette varie motivazioni, tra le quali il tentativo di correggere gli errori del regime di storicità moderno centrato sul futuro e sul superamento in molti casi, anche distruttivo, del passato; oppure l'ipertrofia del presente nel mondo attuale e la crisi di identità che in esso si manifesta e che esige il senso della

1 François Hartog, "Tempo e patrimonio", *Varia Historia* 22, no. 36 (2006): 261-73. Disponibile online : <<https://doi.org/10.1590/S0104-87752006000200002>>.

temporalità nella sua integralità: quale l'origine e il fine dell'istante presente? Oggi il patrimonio si è imposto come categoria dominante della vita culturale e delle politiche pubbliche a livello mondiale. Sono sorti «nuovi tipi di patrimonio» e «nuovi usi» del patrimonio. In questo scenario, i concetti di patrimonio si rivelano sempre più diversificati. Hartog cita l'esempio del santuario di Ise, dedicato alla dea Amaterasu, mitico antenato della casa imperiale giapponese, ricostruito in modo identico in legno di cipresso giapponese ogni venti anni, a partire dal settimo secolo, data della sua fondazione. Nel processo di ricostruzione costante, ciò che conta è la permanenza della forma. Il dilemma occidentale di «conservare o restaurare» non esiste. In Giappone, secondo una legge del 1950, gli artisti o artigiani sono definiti 'tesori nazionali viventi', in quanto detentori di un importante patrimonio culturale immateriale da trasmettere alle nuove generazioni. Il passato conta certamente, ma l'ordine del tempo funziona diversamente che in Europa. L'esempio citato dallo storico francese mette in luce che i concetti di patrimonio sono diversi e devono essere compresi nella loro diversità. A tale scopo ci sembra fondamentale, nel caso delle riduzioni, che si realizzino studi di campo sulle elaborazioni della temporalità proprie delle comunità locali e della loro memoria collettiva che ne raccolgano le narrative attraverso i metodi della storia orale, della psicologia sociale e comunitaria e dell'antropologia fenomenologica. Questi studi fornirebbero una conoscenza rigorosa e diretta delle concezioni di patrimonio culturale delle popolazioni, senza inferirle da punti di osservazione esterni, o paradigmi costruiti in altri contesti o preconconcetti ideologici.

Hartog afferma che il patrimonio è un "modo di vivere le rotture, di riconoscerle e ridurle", "una risorsa per i tempi di crisi» (270–72). In questo senso, il contributo di Maximiliano von Thünghen è decisivo per le circostanze contemporanee della vita delle popolazioni latinoamericane. Infatti, il patrimonio culturale permette il recupero della memoria storica e questa contribuisce alla ricostruzione di "modelli di identificazione che, invece di imprigionare e alienare i popoli, aprino un orizzonte per la loro liberazione e realizzazione».²

IEA-USP, São Paulo

Marina Massimi

2 Ignacio Martín-Baró, *Writings for a Liberation Psychology*. A. Aaron and S. Corne, eds. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 32. La traduzione è nostra.

Maurice Whitehead, ed., *Memory, Martyrs, and Mission. Essays to Commemorate the 850th Anniversary of the Martyrdom of St Thomas Becket (c. 1118–1170)*. Roma: Cangemi, 2020. 144pp. €24.00. ISBN 9788849240078.

In 2018, the Venerable English College in Rome – which from 1579 was in the care of the Society of Jesus until the latter's suppression in 1773 – celebrated three key events connected to its devotional and institutional life: the 900th anniversary of the birth of the college church's patron, St. Thomas Becket, the 450th anniversary of the founding of the English College in Douai, and the 200th anniversary of the re-opening of the Venerable English College in Rome. On that occasion, a symposium was held and the contributions that were the fruit of that celebration have now been published in seven chapters. The publication of *Memory, Martyrs, and Mission* in 2020 is significant: it is the year that marks the 850th anniversary of St. Thomas's death and the 800th anniversary of the establishment of his shrine, now lost, in Canterbury.

The contributors to this publication are diverse and esteemed scholars in their fields, and some have a personal connection to the English College. The papers presented not only deal with the *Venerabile*, but also focus on the significance of Thomas Becket for the English clergy in general, and in particular for the English College in Douai and for the presence of English clergy on the continent in the post-Reformation period, the return of priestly formation in England, and its continuation in seminaries today and in the future, and, finally, for the musical traditions surrounding the devotion of Becket.

In the first chapter, Nicholas Schofield presents the biography of St. Thomas Becket and the evolution of his devotion, both in England and in the Venerable English College. It is a very helpful chapter to situate the importance of the patron saint of the college church and it opens the way for the following chapters in the publication. Schofield describes in a clear way how Henry VIII attempted to obliterate Becket's memory; he further outlines how the focus on Becket's un-Englishness among Protestant polemicists was in strong contrast to the importance the archbishop had for the English Catholic exiles. The author shows how, in the early-modern period, Becket became an example for the Catholic faithful in times of trial. Schofield then turns to the Victorian period, when Becket was seen as a role model for a time marked by revolution and nationalism, liberalism and anti-clericalism.

The second chapter, by Eamon Duffy, focuses on the foundation of the English Colleges of Douai and Rheims, but, contrary to what the title suggests, does not deal directly with the *Venerabile* in Rome. In the period following the Council of Trent, Douai was founded as a Tridentine seminary, the new way of forming future priests. But Duffy points out important differences with respect to a Tridentine seminary: Douai was very much aimed at mission in a specific context and the curriculum was adapted accordingly. Scripture had a central position so that the future priests would be able to dispute with the Protestant reformers. Duffy pays attention to Gregory Martin's translation of the Bible (the Rheims-Douai version) and highlights how it functioned as a weapon against the Protestants. Also the role of Thomas Stapleton comes clearly to the fore. At the English College a new kind of priest was being formed: they were highly educated and ready to enter into controversy with Protestants. By the 1590s public disputations with Protestants in England were no longer possible, so the English College became more conventional.

Peter Davidson gives an overview of the cultural life of the English colleges on the continent in the third chapter. He convincingly shows how these colleges were not only seminaries, but also cultural centres for exiles. They were dynamic and in touch with the European mainstream culture, much more than with British culture. The cultural production at the colleges was very diverse, but markedly oppositional: it reacted clearly against the political regimes of early modern Britain. Davidson discusses the iconography of the *Venerabile*, the statue of Nuestra Señora Vulnerata in Valladolid, emblems, poetry, and Jesuit school plays in Latin. He indicates how the culture at the colleges had a slow but clear influence on the culture in Britain, which was self-secluded at the time and how the cultural production at the colleges was strongly influenced by the Jesuit cultural production in colleges all over the continent.

In the fourth chapter, Carol M. Richardson focuses on the frescoes in the church of the Venerable English College. They are now lost, but a publication with engravings based on the frescoes is extant. She stresses the importance of Bede's *Ecclesiastical History* in the curriculum and the influence it had on the iconographical programme. The frescoes deal with martyrdom and were executed by Pomarancio, who also made the frescoes depicting martyrs in Santo Stefano Rotondo, the church of the Collegium Germanicum which was also in the care of the Jesuits and which also formed

seminarians to return to Protestant lands. Richardson does not elaborate on this, but it might be interesting to compare the frescoes and see if there are any similarities in the programme and how they are linked to the specific Jesuit imagery. The frescoes of the English College focus on historical English martyrs, monarchs loyal to Rome, and the martyrs of the English College itself. The fact that Bede's writings had an influence on the iconography is significant, because of his Englishness. The frescoes' on the English martyrs, while their Tudor persecutors were of Welsh origin, evinces something about how the English College saw itself. In terms of the college's strong historical ties to both England and Wales (through its staff and student cohorts), Richardson alludes to the many problems that existed between the English and Welsh residents of the English College, which the latter significantly referred to as the *Seminarium Britannicum*. The further research Richardson is doing on this subject promises to be very interesting.

Peter Philips deals with the events of the various English colleges after the French Revolution in chapter five. He compellingly tells the story of how seminarians made their way back from the college in Douai to England in difficult circumstances, and how the successor of the Douai College was founded in England. However, there seems to have been a mistake in the dates mentioned. Philips indicates that the seminarians were forced to leave the college in Douai, but were allowed to go back in November 1794, but then they landed in Britain on Monday 2 March 1794 (p. 68). Probably this should be 1795, as 2 March was a Monday in that year. The story of the Venerable English College in Rome emerges as more complex than the other English colleges and shows the "relentless petty squabbling" of Churchmen (p. 77) and its many political implications. Philips pays special attention to the role of John Lingard, one of the last students at Douai who was instrumental in the foundation of the seminaries in England and the restoration of the *Venerabile*.

The interesting sixth chapter is the odd one out in this collection. Written by Judith Champ, it does not deal with the past as the other papers, but rather with the present and the future. It deals with the formation of priests and how it can and ought to be rethought for the future. Champ analyses the historical evolution of formation and shows how there has been a gradual distance between laypeople and the seminarians, which tends to engender clericalism. She claims that laypeople, especially women, should be more involved in institutional discernment processes and in

formation. She argues that the formation of priests should be seen as a task of the entire parish community. In this sense, we can learn from the post-Reformation period, when laypeople were actively involved in supporting the mission of priests, hiding them in their homes, even at the risk of their own lives.

The seventh and last chapter deals with Catholic liturgical music for St. Thomas Becket, both in Britain and on the continent throughout history. Peter Leech distinguishes two main periods and his chapter focuses mainly on the second period (post-Reformation until the present), on the basis that there has been a disproportionate amount of scholarly attention for the first period. Leech shows how this music in post-Reformation Britain is very rare. On the continent, the situation was somewhat different, since the devotion for Becket was important to English exiles, but also because the number of Masses composed in Becket's honour is surprisingly low. There are many shorter musical treatments which circulated in Europe. The Low Countries, and especially Antwerp, was an important centre, also because of its high number of English exiles. Leech focuses on the *Venerabile* and shows that the best Roman musicians were hired by the College for the celebrations of Becket each year. However, this contribution remains very hypothetical and he admits that his search to establish any possible link for a musical setting dedicated to Becket has resulted in mainly tentative conclusions. When he tries to link Palestrina with the *Venerabile*, he says that "it is not beyond the realms of possibility" that a piece was written for the *Venerabile*. These assertions mainly indicate that further research is needed and that little can be established with certainty at this point.

The editor is to be congratulated for this relevant and well-edited publication. It contains helpful material at the back, such as musical scores, and full colour images. Most of them are of high quality, but sadly, one is not (3.2). Another image of a frontispiece has been cut on the sides (3.4). Several times in the publication, the authors refer to images which are included in the book, but no reference is given in the text (e.g. p. 20, 41, 53). On other occasions, the references given are to the wrong image (e.g. p. 42, 43). These small issues hinder an even more satisfactory reading of the text, but they do not diminish this publication that highlights the specificity of the English Catholic Church and the important role of the continental English colleges and in particular that of the *Venerabile* in Rome.

Giovanni Coco, *Il labirinto romano. Il filo delle relazioni Chiesa-Stato tra Pio XI, Pacelli e Mussolini (1929-1939)*. 2 voll. Città del Vaticano: Archivio Segreto Vaticano, 2019. 1428pp. € 75.00. ISBN 978-8898638123.

L'apertura alla consultazione dei fondi dell'Archivio Apostolico Vaticano per il pontificato di Pio XII (1939-1958), avvenuta il 2 marzo 2019, trova nell'imponente opera di Giovanni Coco, che reca il numero 110 nell'elenco dei volumi della *Collectanea Archivi Vaticani*, una naturale premessa, cornice e guida. Nei due tomi, suddivisi in 9 capitoli articolati in 28 sezioni, l'autore analizza con prosa agile il complesso intreccio delle relazioni fra Chiesa e Stato nel decennio 1929-1939 che vede in Pio XI, Eugenio Pacelli e Benito Mussolini la "triade protagonista", secondo la definizione di Emilio Gentile nella prefazione, "contornata da numerosissimi altri protagonisti, maggiori e minori".

Nell'*Introduzione* alle 1305 pagine di testo Coco fornisce al lettore, con tratti essenziali e di chirurgica precisione, la struttura di base per la lettura del testo e, al contempo, una chiave interpretativa, fra le tante possibili, dei fatti narrati. Il riferimento è innanzitutto a Roma, che "sarebbe tornata ad essere il luogo del confronto tra il successore di Pietro e un aspirante Cesare", alla "verticalizzazione dei processi decisionali", che consente di accostare Pio XI e Mussolini nel *modus agendi*, ed infine a quella "serie di variabili esterne" rappresentate "dalla Francia repubblicana, la Germania di Weimar e poi di Hitler, la Russia di Stalin, la Spagna di Franco, come l'Austria di Dollfuss, la Polonia di Pilsudski, il Regno Unito e infine gli Stati Uniti di Roosevelt" che tanto condizionarono scelte, reazioni e relazioni nel rapporto tra Italia e Santa Sede. Più di 120 pagine di *Prologo* sul periodo 1922-1931 conducono il lettore all'ingresso del *labirinto* costituito dalla firma dei Patti Lateranensi nel febbraio 1929 e dalla nomina di Pacelli a Segretario di Stato nel febbraio 1930.

Vasto ed articolato lo scenario delle fonti, che vede quelle archivistiche avere un ruolo preminente. Fra gli archivi ecclesiastici, il ruolo di protagonista è, evidentemente, dell'ex Archivio Segreto Vaticano, in particolare degli archivi delle rappresentanze pontificie (Nunziature, Internunziature, Delegazioni Apostoliche) e del fondo *Segreteria di Stato*. Imprescindibili anche le carte conservate presso l'Archivio Storico della Segreteria di Stato, Sezione Rapporti con gli Stati, come pure le fonti provenienti dagli archivi di vari dicasteri della Curia Romana, in particolare la Congregazione per le Chiese Orientali e la Congregazione per

la Dottrina della Fede. Fra gli archivi di ordini ed istituti religiosi, oltre all'Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu, si segnalano quelli degli Assunzionisti e dei Domenicani. Molti anche gli archivi civili, in Italia e all'estero: *in primis* l'Archivio Centrale dello Stato e l'Archivio Storico Diplomatico del Ministero degli Affari Esteri, ma anche i National Archives di Londra, Les Archives diplomatiques du Ministère des Affaires Étrangères de La Courneuve ed il Bundesarchiv a Berlino. Accanto alle collezioni documentarie editate (Documenti Diplomatici Italiani, Documents diplomatiques français, Actes et documents du Saint-Siège relatifs à la période de la Seconde Guerre Mondiale, ed altre) ed alle varie memorie e diari (Confalonieri, Venini, Ciano, Charles-Roux, solo per citarne alcuni), vanno ricordati almeno i "Fogli di udienza del cardinale Pacelli" (1930-1939) ed il *Diario* del card. Domenico Tardini (1936-1944), ai quali viene dato già nell'Introduzione il dovuto rilievo.

In più punti dell'opera è menzionato lo sforzo di sintesi operato ai fini sia dell'economia complessiva del lavoro che degli obiettivi prefissati. E funzionali a questo scopo risultano sia la *Bibliografia* che gli *Indici*, la cui ricchezza restituisce la rappresentazione plastica del lungo e minuzioso lavoro operato sulle fonti, a partire dalla selezione delle stesse. Le 77 pagine della corposa *Bibliografia* sono state organizzate in *Dizionari e Repertori*, *Collezioni di Fonti e di Testi editi*, *Diari e Memorie* e *Monografie e Articoli*, e presenta le caratteristiche di essenzialità, completezza e prossimità temporale dichiarate già nell'introduzione. Efficace anche la sezione degli indici analitici, articolata in Indici delle fonti d'archivio (22 pagg.), delle citazioni bibliche (2 pagg.) e dei nomi di persona (38 pagg.), che consentono di muoversi rapidamente ed agilmente tra pagine, capitoli e sezioni. Molto utile, infine, la *Prosopografia*, che in 58 pagine e 330 note biografiche aiuta il lettore a calare nel contesto i personaggi, principali e secondari, alla luce del ruolo svolto durante il dipanarsi dei fatti ed in considerazione del percorso precedente e successivo al ruolo svolto ad un dato momento del racconto. Le 1205 note a piè di pagina, infine, rendono bene l'idea, se mai ce ne fosse ancora bisogno, della minuziosa accuratezza degli apparati, che sollecitano positivamente il lettore ad ulteriori approfondimenti.

Il libro di Coco ha la forza ed il peso della pietra miliare, rappresenta un caposaldo per chiunque voglia occuparsi, e sotto diversi punti di vista, dei rapporti tra Chiesa e Stato nel decennio 1929-1939. La storia si intreccia alle storie, i fatti sono raccontati anche tramite le vicende personali dei protagonisti, lasciando

trapelare gli aspetti caratteriali e, spesso, anche la costante ricerca di un difficile equilibrio tra slanci e ponderatezze, rischi e cautele, certezze e dubbi. Dalle pagine emerge in tutta la propria evidenza la complessità di vicende intricate, contraddittorie, talvolta incoerenti, che spesso, anche recentemente, sono state approcciate alla luce di singoli aspetti e non in modo organico. Un labirinto, appunto, nel quale Coco guida il lettore con la consueta maestria.

ARSI, Roma

Sergio Palagiano

Guido Mongini (a cura di), *L'eresia della preghiera. Gesuiti e Pelagini tra Lombardia e Veneto nel Seicento*, Alessandria: Edizioni dell'Orso, 2021. XI+241pp. €18.00. ISBN 978-88-3613-161-7.

Il presente volume a cura di Guido Mongini rappresenta un contributo significativo allo studio del movimento dei cosiddetti "pelagini", movimento "eterodosso" di carattere mistico della seconda metà del Seicento. Nato dall'iniziativa del laico Giacomo Filippo Casolo, che istituì un oratorio a Santa Pelagia a Milano, esso si radicò in diverse città della Lombardia e del Veneto per essere poi oggetto della repressione inquisitoriale, a diverse riprese fino alla sua soppressione alla fine del secolo. Associato un tempo al fenomeno quietista (ed etichettato, un po' teleologicamente, come "prequietismo"), il fenomeno pelagino è stato per la prima volta colto nella sua identità e vicenda inquisitoriale da Gianvittorio Signorotto, in un volume uscito nel 1989 (*Inquisitori e mistici nel Seicento italiano. L'eresia di Santa Pelagia*). Da allora però, tranne per alcuni significativi contributi di Angelo Turchini (nel 1991) e Lisa Roscioni (2010 e 2011), l'argomento non è stato oggetto di ulteriori approfondimenti.

Questo volume rappresenta la prima tappa di un progetto di ricerca sul fenomeno pelagino coordinato da Guido Mongini, che indaga un esteso *corpus* di processi inquisitoriali contenuti in sette faldoni conservati nell'Archivio dell'ex Sant'Ufficio (e resi disponibili agli storici a partire dalla sua apertura nel 1998). La documentazione esaminata conferma le tre fasi del movimento già individuate da Signorotto: una prima che riguarda Santa Pelagia, il suo fondatore e gli oratori in Valcamonica (1655-57); una breve seconda fase che concerne Francesco Giuseppe Borri, seguace di Casolo e divenuto esponente di spicco del movimento (1657-58); e una terza fase che arriva fino agli inizi del Settecento e che ricopre l'intera terraferma

veneta (tra cui le città di Brescia, Verona, Padova, Treviso e Udine).

I nove saggi contenuti nel volume – aperto dall'introduzione del curatore – offrono una panoramica del fenomeno pelagino e dei contesti in cui si esprime e da cui originò: il primo, di Marzia Giuliani, conduce il lettore "dentro" la casa madre milanese di Santa Pelagia; altri tre esaminano i dossier inquisitoriali dei processi ai principali protagonisti pelagini (Michela Catto indaga le testimonianze di monache al processo di Borri, rilevanti anche per la devozione resa a Casolo; Benedetto Fassanelli prende in esame i sommari dei processi di Francesco Negri e Giovanni Agostino Recaldini; Liliana Billanovich analizza il processo di Bartolomeo Griffi); Guido Mongini discute il legame tra Casolo e i gesuiti, attraverso la figura e il processo di Alberto Alberti; Irene Gaddo esamina il *Libro di rivelazioni* di Francesco Negri. Altri tre saggi, infine, discutono alcune esperienze spirituali affini ai Pelagini: David Aeby e Danilo Zardin investigano i modelli devozionali promossi dai gesuiti; mentre, per concludere, Pierluigi Giovannucci considera la vicenda quietista.

I saggi anzitutto ci restituiscono l'esperienza spirituale dei pelagini, fondata sull'orazione mentale (ritenuta necessaria alla salvezza), sul discredito delle pratiche esteriori e sulla direzione spirituale. Il movimento coltivava posizioni critiche nei confronti della Chiesa istituzionale, che mirava a superare e a sostituire con un nuovo ordine basato sui gradi di perfezione raggiunti nella preghiera. Se tali idee sono messe in rilievo in quasi tutti i saggi del volume, particolarmente importante è il ritrovamento e l'esame da parte di Gaddo di uno dei testi fondamentali dei pelagini (finora conosciuto solo in una versione ridotta): il *Libro di Rivelazioni* composto da Giovanni Agostino Recaldini, il quale raccolse le rivelazioni del laico (forse illetterato) Francesco Negri – Gaddo ha altresì curato la pubblicazione dell'intero scritto in altra sede, sempre per l'editore dell'Orso. Allo stato attuale della ricerca è difficile però dire (come osserva anche Billanovich) se il movimento si possa considerare univoco dal punto di vista degli ideali spirituali e delle modalità organizzative. A questo riguardo Catto scorge significative differenze tra Casolo, l'iniziatore del movimento, e il suo seguace Borri. Altrettanto rilevante sembra essere il dissidio, messo a fuoco nel saggio di Fassanelli, tra Negri e Recaldini negli anni Ottanta (per quanto avvenuto in sede processuale) a proposito della direzione spirituale, che il primo riteneva ormai inutile anteporrendole la necessità di seguire unicamente la volontà divina.

Il volume enfatizza in particolare l'influsso della matrice spiritualistica dei gesuiti sulla dimensione interiore e "illuministica"

del movimento pelagino. Il saggio di Giuliani esamina un fascicolo manoscritto in uso a Santa Pelagia in cui si osservano pratiche spirituali simili a quelle promosse dai manuali dei gesuiti nelle congregazioni mariane. Anche i saggi di Aeby e Zardin mostrano la compatibilità degli ideali spirituali pelagini rispettivamente con i manuali in uso nelle congregazioni mariane istituite dai gesuiti e con autori di trattati devoti dell'ordine come Gregorio Ferrari, che davano grande importanza all'orazione mentale (e nel caso di Ferrari, persino alla "deificazione" dell'uomo), pur non disgiunta dal disciplinamento interiore o da pratiche devote di carattere esteriore. Sulla stessa linea si pone il contributo di Mongini, che esamina il ruolo del gesuita Alberto Alberti, autore di scritti in difesa di Casolo, di Santa Pelagia, degli oratori della Valcamonica e delle loro pratiche (in primis dell'orazione mentale, che egli sosteneva appartenere alla tradizione della Chiesa e alla prassi gesuitica), tanto da essere a sua volta accusato di eresia e da trovarsi coinvolto nel processo contro altri esponenti del movimento, tra cui Borri. Se i saggi del volume dimostrano in maniera indiscutibile l'importanza dei gesuiti nell'orientare l'esperienza degli oratori pelagini e nel diffondere la pratica dell'orazione mentale, nella documentazione esaminata (ad esempio da Giuliani su Santa Pelagia) sembra emergere il sostegno agli ideali pelagini anche da parte di altre congregazioni religiose, quali gli oratoriani di Filippo Neri (dal quale il fondatore dei pelagini, Casolo, prese il nome), gli oblati, le orsoline e i carmelitani scalzi – tema che forse meriterebbe di essere approfondito ulteriormente in future ricerche.

I contributi di Billanovich e Giovannucci, invece, mettono a confronto il fenomeno pelagino con il movimento quietista per sottolineare alcune differenze fondamentali, quali la dimensione comunitaria dei primi (contrapposta all'individualismo dei secondi) e alcuni aspetti terminologici che rivelano radici intellettuali diverse (il termine "orazione di quiete" non appare nei processi ai pelagini, che parlano di "orazione mentale"). I due gruppi sono però accumulati dalla svalutazione delle opere e di ogni apparato esteriore del culto, compresi gli uffici ecclesiastici.

La raccolta di saggi edita da Mongini porta indubbiamente in superficie la complessa ramificazione dell'eresia pelagina nella società e mostra come tale movimento, oltre ai laici (presenti in tutte le componenti sociali), coinvolse ecclesiastici di ogni grado, dai sacerdoti secolari (categoria finora poco considerata) a esponenti di ordini religiosi, fino alle più alte cariche delle gerarchie della Chiesa. Altro tema che emerge con forza dai saggi (in particolare nei

contributi di Giuliani e Catto) è il ruolo delle donne, che potrebbero aver influenzato la devozione mistica del movimento pelagino. Sembra assai significativa infatti la presenza femminile alle radici dell'oratorio di Santa Pelagia (nato da una comunità femminile) e in quelli di Verona e Brescia (come osservano Fassanelli e Billanovich). Viene giustamente rimarcato che figure di monache (la nota mistica Domitilla Galluzzi, ad esempio) furono interlocutrici privilegiate di diversi leader pelagini, come Casolo e Borri, laddove Teresa d'Avila è citata quale fonte di insegnamento spirituale per Casolo, Negri e Recaldini.

Dalla ricca e complessa documentazione scandagliata dagli autori e dalle autrici dei saggi emerge infine l'atteggiamento non lineare e non univoco della Chiesa della tarda Controriforma. Se è vero che alla fine del Seicento si affermò una "svolta antimistica", vero è pure che nell'istituzione ecclesiastica convivevano anime diverse: una incline ad accettare il misticismo contemplativo e un'altra, al contrario, impegnata nella difesa delle pratiche esteriori, delle gerarchie istituzionali e della norma teologica. Del resto, la condanna dei pelagini e del quietismo – entrambi oggetto della repressione inquisitoriale degli anni Ottanta – fu decretata non tanto a partire da assunti teologici contrari alla mistica contemplativa (di per sé ortodossa), ma in considerazione delle possibili conseguenze per la Chiesa esteriore e per l'ordine sociale derivanti da un'idea della salvezza e della perfezione completamente relegata alla dimensione interiore.

Università degli Studi di Teramo

Querciolo Mazzonis

Alice Boeri e Flavio Rurale, eds, *Marie, Maria, Mariana*. Ostuni: Calamospecchia edizioni, 2021. 147pp. €12.00. ISBN 9788894641714.

È sempre suggestivo imbattersi in una pubblicazione di carattere storico che possa fornire al tempo stesso utili strumenti al dibattito contemporaneo, ancor più quando si tratti di temi ineludibili come condizione della donna/parità di genere e comunicazione mendace/faziosa. Questioni cruciali, ieri come oggi, queste, con le degenerazioni del femminicidio e dell'*overload* informativo esponenzialmente enfatizzato da una rete in grado di influenzare mentalità e imporre opinioni a prescindere dalla documentabilità delle notizie: *fake news*.

È il caso dell'agile ma denso libro di Alice Boeri e Flavio Rurale che

propone una sintetica riflessione sulla lettera *Adieu de l'ame du Roy de France et de Navarre Henry le Grand à la Royne. Avec la Defence des Pères Jésuites* della cattolica Marie le Jars detta *mademoiselle de Gournay* (1565-1645), indirizzata a Maria de' Medici in difesa dei gesuiti a seguito dell'assassinio di Enrico IV di Francia, nella traduzione italiana svolta sul testo edito a Parigi nel 1610, curata dalla stessa Boeri.

Marie de Gournay, donna colta e singolare esponente nel panorama intellettuale dell'epoca, "fille d'alliance" di Michel de Montaigne di cui curò l'edizione critica dei *Saggi*, fu un esempio rimarchevole di protofemminismo, come risulta peraltro evidente dalla sua pubblicazione *Égalité des Hommes et des Femmes* (1622).

Il suo schierarsi pubblicamente in difesa dei gesuiti, tema centrale del testo, considerati i mandanti morali dell'uccisione del re, è reso ancor più arduo dalla sua condizione femminile che l'aveva sottoposta a prevaricazioni, umiliazioni e calunnie.

Marie, nel suo *Adieu* ricorre a narrazioni mitiche secondo un'estetica classicista che rifugge dalle spinte letterarie riformatrici di matrice malherbiana. Tra i miti evocati quello di Niobe risulta particolarmente rappresentativo rispetto ad entrambe le tematiche. "La lingua troncata, il pianto impietrito, la negazione della comunicazione: dopo la violenza fisica quella che impone il silenzio. [...] – come osserva Rurale, nel suo acuto e appassionato saggio introduttivo – Marie è parte di un mondo di intellettuali prettamente maschile, di circoli letterari che stigmatizzano il desiderio di apprendere delle donne, svalutano i loro discorsi e si sottraggono al confronto con esse" (p. 22). Lo denuncia la stessa de Gournay nella sua lettera alla regina quando scrive: "Ogni condizione sana e forte è considerata ridicola e rifiutata in questi tempi, e ripugnante per le donne fino all'ingiuria se non sono temute, perché l'esempio del loro sesso su cui le si vuole attaccare è di qualche grado inferiore a quello maschile, il quale è attualmente già oltremodo considerato [...]" (p. 134).

Sin dalla scelta dell'icastico titolo *Marie, Maria, Mariana* traspare la volontà degli autori di evocare, anche onomasticamente, le corrispondenze fra i tre personaggi-chiave della trattazione: Marie de Gournay, Maria de' Medici, vedova e reggente del regno di Francia e il gesuita Juan de Mariana, autore del *De Rege et Regis Institutione* che giungeva a legittimare il diritto di resistenza al sopruso sino al tirannicidio.

Le corrispondenze tra mittente, destinatario e "mandante" si concludono, nel paragrafo finale, con efficace salto temporale nella postilla Mariana/Marianne, mitica figura assunta ad emblema della

Rivoluzione Francese e con il cui appellativo erano denominati dai loro avversari i sostenitori della Repubblica, con palese riferimento al gesuita, membro di quell'ordine religioso soppresso nell'era dei Lumi dopo una violenta ed estenuante polemica alimentata da una pubblicistica non esente da strumentalizzazioni ideologiche.

Così la voce femminile che si leva in difesa dei gesuiti ricorda alla sua regina: "Non mi pento affatto di aver detto in qualche luogo che ci vuole più buonsenso a governare un orecchio che uno Stato" (p. 74).

Infine il pregio di questa raffinata edizione risiede nell'aver divulgato anche per il pubblico italiano un testo efficace per decifrare, negli echi del passato, le dinamiche relazionali della comunicazione contemporanea.

Roma

Tiziana Maria Di Blasio

Patrizia Cavazzini, *Porta virtutis. Il processo a Federico Zuccari*. Roma: De Luca Editori d'Arte, 2020. 192pp. €28.00. ISBN: 978-88-6557-489-8.

Con il libro *Porta Virtutis* di Patrizia Cavazzini si inaugura una nuova collana di studi d'arte, *Artisti in tribunale*, diretta da Michele Di Sivo e Massimo Moretti. Per chiarire meglio il senso del progetto si ricorda che Di Sivo, già vicedirettore dell'Archivio di Stato di Roma, dei fondi d'archivio storici e artistici ha fatto la sua materia d'insegnamento e di ricerca; inoltre Moretti, docente di storia dell'arte moderna presso la Sapienza Università di Roma, utilizza sempre nei suoi studi la ricerca d'archivio come elemento costitutivo delle indagini, non relegandola a mero riferimento di nota.

Nella *Presentazione. Artisti in tribunale* a firma di entrambi, gli intendimenti prefissi sono ben rimarcati sia per quanto riguarda l'oggetto delle ricerche da pubblicare sia per il metodo scientifico utilizzato. Come appare evidente dal titolo della collana, gli argomenti selezionati riguardano i tanti processi che hanno visto coinvolti degli artisti per motivi legati alla loro attività. Di solito si pensa subito a Caravaggio, della cui situazione processuale oramai si sa presumibilmente quasi tutto. Si tratta, invece, di artisti di vario tipo citati in giudizio giustamente o loro malgrado, o che al contrario hanno ricorso alla giustizia per difendere la loro reputazione artistica. "Delle fonti che ne sono venute si occupa la collana" (p. 7). Si potrebbe pensare a prima vista di argomenti molto ristretti, troppo specifici e

forse anche poco interessanti per un ampio discorso artistico, invece tali fonti offrono spunti di riflessione che portano soprattutto alla constatazione che ogni ricerca artistica se non si radica nel contesto storico da cui prende vita – il committente, l'ambiente culturale e sociale, ecc. – rischia di rimanere sospesa in un limbo di valutazioni estetizzanti con poco fondamento scientifico.

Ritornando al libro che apre questa serie, esso è dedicato al ben noto episodio giudiziario che vede coinvolto il pittore Federico Zuccari in un processo intentato dal Tribunale Criminale del Governatore di Roma, perché reo di aver dipinto un'opera ingiuriosa contro lo scalco papale Paolo Ghiselli, personaggio molto vicino al papa di allora, Gregorio XIII. Il 18 ottobre 1581 Zuccari, infatti, ha affisso davanti alla chiesa dell'Accademia di S. Luca un cartone, *Porta virtutis*, raffigurante un'allegoria alquanto esplicita contro Ghiselli. Pubblicamente così il pittore deride il giudice ignorante (Ghiselli) che si è lasciato convincere dall'adulazione e dalla persuasione (alcuni pittori bolognesi) della superiorità artistica di una pala d'altare del pittore bolognese Cesare Aretusi. Su questa dimostrazione di ignoranza trionfa la virtù del giusto pittore (Zuccari) che è dotato di fatica e diligenza. "Zuccari intendeva rappresentare il trionfo dell'artista virtuoso sui propri critici ignoranti e invidiosi, che usavano la maldicenza per calunniarlo" (p. 91). L'antefatto riguarda la pala d'altare *Processione e visione di san Gregorio Magno*, dipinta da Zuccari nel 1580 su richiesta appunto di Ghiselli per la chiesa di S. Maria del Baraccano a Bologna: la pala però non piace e viene sostituita subito dopo da una simile realizzata dal bolognese Aretusi, considerata dallo stesso Zuccari inferiore stilisticamente. Quest'ultimo, quindi, sentitosi offeso professionalmente, organizza la pubblica esposizione del cartone denigratorio, non sospettando forse che avrebbe provocato delle reazioni così forti, alimentate anche dallo stesso Gregorio XIII. Segue, infatti, un processo che si conclude con una pena molto severa per i canoni dell'epoca: esilio di Zuccari dai territori pontifici, preceduta da una penale di cinquecento scudi per ogni mancata presenza durante il processo.

Anche la Compagnia di Gesù si trova coinvolta a un certo punto in questa complicata vicenda, in quanto Zuccari con una mossa strategica decide di donare la sua tanto vilipesa pala rimasta a Bologna ai Gesuiti ivi residenti. Il rettore del collegio Francesco Palmio, bene inserito nell'ambiente culturale della città, dopo aver sondato diplomaticamente la situazione consultando con uno scambio epistolare il padre generale Acquaviva, accoglie il dono del pittore nella chiesa di S. Lucia.

In ogni caso la situazione penale per Zuccari si risolverà in tempi brevi sia perché al papa serve il pittore per fargli completare la decorazione della Cappella Paolina rimasta interrotta a causa del processo, che per la mediazione del duca Francesco Maria II della Rovere, protettore di Zuccari, che a sua volta lo vuole a Loreto per altre committenze.

Molteplici sono le situazioni e i vari personaggi che hanno preso parte a questa avvincente vicenda processuale, e la studiosa Patrizia Cavazzini riesce a ricostruire con attenta precisione ogni dettaglio, restituendone il valore storico e critico. Tali processi o simili situazioni giudiziarie forniscono, infatti, delle importanti coordinate di ricerca, necessarie, come ci si è resi conto, per la comprensione della realizzazione di un'opera. In questo caso specifico di Zuccari, la pala d'altare rimossa e il cartone contestato vengono documentati da Cavazzini presentando anche una serie sorprendente di disegni e incisioni. Perciò dalla lettura del libro si rimane coinvolti ed arricchiti per la messe di informazioni relative non solo ai saggi critici e alle schede, ma alle altrettante ricche pagine delle appendici con le trascrizioni dei principali documenti. Già si aspetta, quindi, il prossimo volume di questa innovativa collana di studi sull'arte legata ad avvenimenti giuridici.

Pontificia Università Gregoriana, Roma Lydia Salviucci Insolera

Bartłomiej Noszczak, *Za klasztorną furtą. Migawki z życia i działalności jezuitów w Warszawie (1945-1956)* [Dietro la porta del convento. Spezzoni della vita e delle attività dei gesuiti a Varsavia (1945-1956)]. Warszawa: Instytut Pamięci Narodowej - Komisja Ścigania Zbrodni Przeciwko Narodowi Polskiemu, 2020. 512pp. ISBN: 978-83-8098-977-1.

Quando nel 1945 l'Europa occidentale e il resto del mondo libero salutavano la fine della seconda guerra mondiale, la parte orientale del Vecchio Continente entrava in un periodo difficile della sua storia dove la Chiesa e la Compagnia di Gesù non erano certo gli unici soggetti ad affrontare non poche avversità. Grazie ai cambiamenti politici avvenuti alla fine del secolo scorso diverse tematiche legate a quelle vicende sono state oggetto di studio e pubblicazione proprio nei paesi direttamente coinvolti. Una di queste pubblicazioni è il presente lavoro di Bartłomiej Noszczak

che ha come oggetto, i gesuiti a Varsavia negli anni 1945-1956.

Il volume conta tre capitoli preceduti da una breve introduzione e seguiti da un'altrettanto breve conclusione.

Nell'introduzione l'Autore spiega lo scopo e i limiti cronologici del suo studio. Basato soprattutto sulle fonti conservate nell'archivio della Provincia della Polonia Maggiore e Mazovia della Compagnia di Gesù a Varsavia, Noszczak non intende ripercorrere la storia dei gesuiti in Polonia – tema che l'autore stesso definisce una "terra incognita" e che rimane una sfida per gli storici – ma comunque ritiene che il suo lavoro si possa considerare come un passo verso una tale storia (p. 11-12). Un tale approccio, unito al fatto che le fonti utilizzate non sempre siano complete, spiega il termine di "spezzoni" utilizzato nel titolo del libro.

L'Autore ha deciso di dare al suo lavoro una struttura cronologico-tematica, dove il primo capitolo serve da sfondo al racconto principale che si snoda nei due capitoli seguenti. Noszczak comincia con una brevissima storia della Compagnia di Gesù tratteggiando in poche pagine la struttura, la spiritualità e la formazione dell'Ordine ignaziano (capitolo 1).

Alcuni elementi dell'introduzione si trovano anche nel secondo capitolo. Prima di passare alla storia delle tre case che i gesuiti possedevano allora nella capitale polacca, delle loro attività e vita comunitaria, l'Autore si sofferma su alcuni aspetti organizzativi come la figura del superiore locale, l'istituzione della consulta e altre funzioni importanti, come l'ammonitore. Il racconto poi si concentra sulle tre comunità di Varsavia ricordando gli eventi importanti nel funzionamento delle opere esistenti, come la curia provinciale e le parrocchie, non trascurando i vari lavori, soprattutto pastorali, intrapresi dai gesuiti. Soltanto l'ultima parte di questo capitolo si avvicina a ciò che è forse più originale e più interessante in questo libro, cioè l'atteggiamento dei religiosi davanti alle sfide del loro tempo. In particolare, Noszczak osserva come i vari anniversari storici diedero loro occasione di organizzare programmi pastorali e di formazione con i quali volevano rispondere alle esigenze dell'epoca e alle aspettative dei fedeli.

Col terzo e ultimo capitolo siamo nel cuore della questione accennata. Qui, il lettore viene istruito sulla struttura dei servizi segreti dello stato comunista responsabili del controllo e della lotta contro la Chiesa cattolica in genere, e quindi anche contro i gesuiti. Non soltanto il nome, ma anche le attività di questi servizi erano segrete e il continuo sviluppo delle loro reti andava avanti di pari passo col rafforzamento del comunismo in Polonia.

Noszczak menziona alcuni nomi di queste strutture e delle persone coinvolte, nonché cita la letteratura rilevante sull'argomento. Vale la pena ricordare che l'Autore è un esperto in materia. Da diversi anni egli lavora nell'Istituto della Memoria Nazionale (*Instytut Pamięci Narodowej*) – un'istituzione statale responsabile dello studio della storia polacca contemporanea, in particolare quella del periodo del dopoguerra. L'Istituto gestisce anche gli archivi dei servizi segreti polacchi degli anni 1944–1990 (o almeno quello che rimane dopo le purghe effettuate durante i cambiamenti politici del 1989!) e li rende accessibili alla ricerca.

Nel capitolo in questione, Noszczak, oltre a raccontare vari casi di vessazioni e persecuzioni contro i gesuiti di Varsavia, si sofferma anche sugli sforzi portati avanti dalla polizia segreta per reclutare tra gli stessi membri della Compagnia collaboratori in grado di fornire informazioni utili per una migliore sorveglianza dell'Ordine. A pagina 411 egli scrive che la collaborazione dei gesuiti polacchi con la polizia dello stato comunista è un tema che ancora aspetta uno studio serio e completo. Comunque, nelle pagine a venire si trovano alcuni pseudonimi e nomi autentici di chi si sarebbe fatto collaboratore dei servizi segreti.

Tutto sommato – e ciò appare anche nelle conclusioni (pp. 463–72) – l'insieme del panorama offerto è piuttosto positivo per i gesuiti di Varsavia. Essi sono riusciti a resistere alle manovre del potere nemico e superando ostacoli di ogni tipo e a portare avanti il proprio lavoro.

Per i lettori che leggono il polacco non serve ricordare che questo libro si aggiunge alle molteplici pubblicazioni promosse negli ultimi anni allo scopo di fare i conti con il passato. Ciò non riguarda soltanto i gesuiti in Polonia, ma tutta la Chiesa e, più in generale l'insieme della società polacca. In tempi recenti, non di rado, l'ombra del passato ha oscurato la vita politica del Paese. Nei media non sono mancate accuse, per esempio, contro vari personaggi pubblici, anche ecclesiastici, ai quali si rimproverava di aver collaborato con la polizia segreta durante gli anni del comunismo. Fra di loro appaiono anche i nomi di alcuni gesuiti. Così, malgrado il passar del tempo, le ferite del doloroso periodo del dopoguerra non sembrano essere rimarginate e ciò si fa sentire in varie occasioni. Risulta quindi di fondamentale importanza nell'affrontare questo tipo di tematiche, la serietà e la scientificità del metodo storico utilizzato; una analisi attenta delle varie fonti a disposizione che comprenda una loro critica, ossia valutarne l'autenticità e verificarne l'affidabilità.

Ritornando al libro, fra le molte qualità si annovera il fatto che è basato sulla documentazione di un archivio ancora poco conosciuto

e utilizzato. Merita una menzione d'onore l'atteggiamento dell'Autore che chiaramente indica fino a che punto sono arrivate le sue indagini e i limiti oltre i quali non si è spinto. Ad esempio afferma di non conoscere il contenuto della lettera dell'episcopato letta il 31 ottobre 1948 durante una festa della Crociata Eucaristica (p. 208); ammette di non sapere quale influsso all'inizio degli anni 1950 il provinciale Wawryn abbia potuto esercitare sul cardinale primate Wyszyński e sulle sue decisioni riguardanti la relazione con le autorità statali (p. 296-297).

A Noszczak non sfuggono alcune approssimazioni o semplificazioni che meriterebbero di essere corrette nella seconda edizione. Ad esempio, nel 1955 non ricorrevano i quattrocento anni della fondazione della Compagnia (p. 416, nota 410), ma della morte di s. Ignazio (ricorrenza celebrata nel 1956); il padre generale Ledóchowski non avrebbe potuto cambiare nulla delle regole liturgiche dei gesuiti nell'ottobre 1947 (p. 153), perché era morto nel dicembre del 1942; prima dell'agosto del 1926 non si poteva entrare in una delle province polacche della Compagnia, perché a quell'epoca esisteva un'unica provincia polacca (p. 180), etc.

Il libro, comunque, entrerà di buon diritto nel patrimonio bibliografico dedicato alla storia della Compagnia di Gesù, ma anche alla storia polacca contemporanea. Limitandoci alla sola Compagnia di Gesù, segnaliamo che i gesuiti di Cracovia hanno portato avanti un lavoro sul tema della collaborazione dei religiosi di quella provincia con la polizia segreta comunista. I frutti delle lunghe ricerche sono stati presentati durante un convegno accademico e pubblicati col titolo *Komunistyczny aparat represji wobec jezuitów Prowincji Polski Południowej* [L'apparato comunista di repressione nei confronti dei gesuiti della Provincia di Polonia Meridionale] (ed. Andrzej Paweł Bieś, Filip Musiał. Kraków, Oddział IPN w Krakowie – Wydawnictwo WAM, 2014).

Per quanto riguarda i gesuiti di Varsavia, gli anni recenti hanno visto il nascere di alcune pubblicazioni sotto la loro egida. Qui menzioniamo il volume curato dallo stesso Noszczak con i ricordi del Padre Bulanda, provinciale della Provincia di Polonia Maggiore e Mazovia negli anni 1948–1952, imprigionato nel 1950–1951: Edward Bulanda, *Wspomnienia jezuity (1939-1954)*. [I ricordi del gesuita (1939-1954)], Warszawa, Instytut Pamięci Narodowej. Komisja Ścigania Zbrodni przeciwko Narodowi Polskiemu, 2017; e il volume che raccoglie le "Riflessioni" del P. Gurgacz – il cappellano di una delle formazioni militari che lottavano contro le autorità comuniste, fucilato nel 1949: Władysław Gurgacz, *Refleksje* (ed.

Maria Chodyko, Krzysztof Dorosz. Warszawa, Instytut Pamięci Narodowej, Komisja Ścigania Zbrodni Przeciwko Narodowi Polskiemu, 2020). Tutte queste pubblicazioni, compreso il libro qui recensito, costituiscono un vero e proprio progresso nella storiografia gesuitica che non cessa di attirare l'attenzione di molti studiosi, anche in Polonia.

ARSI, Roma

Robert Danieluk SJ

Robert T. Tomczak, *Kontakty edukacyjne Polaków z uniwersytetami praskimi w XVI-XVIII wieku. Studium prozopograficzne*. Poznań: Wydział Historii UAM, 2021. 264pp. ISBN: 978-83-66355-60-6.

In his research to date, the Poznań-based historian Robert Tomczak mainly focuses on education history, with particular attention to the Poles attending foreign universities in the medieval and early modern periods. This book, based on the author's doctoral thesis, supplements his former research on the Polish students in Prague before 1526 (*Kontakty edukacyjne Polaków z uniwersytetami praskimi w okresie średniowiecza. Studium prozopograficzne*, Poznań: Wydział Historii UAM, 2020). Due to the Society's presence in Prague, this book—*Kontakty edukacyjne Polaków z uniwersytetami praskimi w XVI-XVIII wieku. Studium prozopograficzne*—constitutes a valuable contribution to the field of Jesuit studies.

In his study, Tomczak adopts a prosopographical approach and identifies more than two hundred students associated with the various Prague universities between 1526 and 1773. In terms of sources, he enlists an extensive variety of manuscript records, including the admission and promotion registers, Jesuit catalogues, travel diaries, and private letters. Among iconographic sources, he pays attention to graphic theses. Since earlier research in the field has mostly emphasized the role of universities in the education of foreign elites during the Middle Ages, Tomczak's work fills an important research gap by focusing on the early modern period. Moreover, it analyses an important secondary centre of the republic of letters like Prague. From the methodological point of view, the book applies the rigorous standards set by medieval historians to identify students and verify whether Poles known to have studied in Prague actually attended university courses. The author is aware of the interpretive problems related to university registers and takes into consideration

the early-modern social reality and educational practices.

The scope of research is clearly defined. Tomczak refers to Poles as the inhabitants of the Kingdom of Poland (after 1569 the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth), thus including not only ethnic Poles but also the inhabitants of Royal Prussia, the Grand Duchy of Lithuania, and Livonia. Moreover, he focuses on university students, excluding those who attended the school of the cathedral chapter, monastic schools, priest seminaries, or Jesuit secondary schools. The chronological scope is also clearly defined: the *terminus a quo* 1526 coincides with the ascent of the Habsburgs to the Czech throne, while the *terminus ad quem* 1773 coincides with the suppression of the Society of Jesus. The research appropriately aims at reconstructing the social and geographic origin of students, their academic career, and social advance. It succeeds very well in this objective.

The book structure, based on chronological and institutional criteria, is well thought out. In the first chapter, Tomczak focuses on the University founded in 1348 by the King of Bohemia Charles I (r. 1346–78, Emperor of the Holy Roman Empire as Charles IV in 1355–78), which had become an Utraquist stronghold after the Hussite wars. Due to its Protestant character, the *Carolinum* remained relatively unpopular among Polish students despite opening up to Humanism in the mid-sixteenth century.

Chapter two deals with the Jesuit Academy created in 1571 by Pope Pius V (r. 1566–72). This was an extension of the Jesuit college *Clementinum* opened in 1556, consisting of a philosophical and theological faculty. Since the first promotions of non-Jesuit students were held in 1573, the author adopts this year as the starting point for the study. Compared to the Utraquist *Carolinum*, the *Clementinum* was characterized by a higher degree of internationalization and became popular among Polish students.

Chapter three focuses on the transition period between the suppression of the Utraquist University in 1622 and the creation of Charles-Ferdinand University in 1654 by Emperor Ferdinand III (r. 1636–57), during which the number of Polish students decreased as a result of the Thirty Years' War.

Chapter four presents the Charles-Ferdinand University, created through the merging of the *Clementinum*'s philosophical and theological faculties, and the *Carolinum*'s law and medicine faculties. Despite the Jesuit monopoly on philosophy and theology teaching, the *Carolo-Ferdinandum* was not fully a Jesuit university since it remained under the Emperor's control and employed secular professors of medicine and law. In the 1750s the autonomy

of Jesuit teaching was further reduced by Maria Theresa's (r. 1740–80) educational reforms. The Charles-Ferdinand University attracted many Polish students: about one hundred of them studied there in the second half of the seventeenth century. Among them, there were Michał Wiśniowiecki (1640–73) and Krzysztof Antoni Szembek (1667–1748), who later became respectively King of Poland and Archbishop of Gniezno.

Tomczak demonstrates that Prague played an important role in the education of Poles. Unlike other foreign destinations, the Bohemian capital, relatively close to Polish borders, was popular among burghers. Compared to the Polish nobility, whose main travel goal was to acquire good manners and learn foreign languages, burghers more often accomplished orderly studies and graduated in Prague. Many of them joined various religious orders and made ecclesiastic careers in Bohemia. The attractiveness of Prague varied through time. The number of students was high at the turn of the sixteenth- and seventeenth centuries and in the second half of the seventeenth century. Most students came from the Western territories of Poland-Lithuania, such as Greater Poland and Royal Prussia. The small number of students from Lesser Poland can be explained by the existence of another Jesuit Academy in Olomouc.

Brief biographical notes about each student are included in the appendix.

The monograph is an important contribution to the field of Jesuit studies, since it analyses the career of Polish Jesuits in the Bohemian Province. Some of them were granted posts of responsibility: for instance, both Teofil Krystecki¹ and Andrzej Schambogen² were rectors in Prague, while Fryderyk Kazimierz Wolff von Lüdinghausen³ carried out important diplomatic missions. Another significant aspect consists in the studies of Jesuits from the Polish and Lithuanian Provinces in Prague. Although Jesuit legislation prescribed the self-sufficiency of each province regarding religious

1 Teofil Krystecki, * 1561 Biecz (Poland), SJ before 1581, † 3.XI.1622 Krosno (Poland) (Robert Tomczak, "Polish Professors at Prague Universities (14th-18th centuries). A prosopographic study". *Acta Universitatis Carolinae - Historia Universitatis Carolinae Pragensis* 60.1 (2020): 94).

2 Andrzej Schambogen * 15.IX.1610 Pieniężno (Poland), SJ 24.III.1629 Brno, † 24.I.1655 Prague (ibid. 95).

3 Fryderyk Kazimierz Wolff von Lüdinghausen, * 16.X.1643 Daugavpils (Latvia), SJ 13.XII.1659 Olomouc, † 17.IV.1708 Wrocław (ibid. 96).

formation, many Jesuits from Poland-Lithuania were welcomed in the Bohemian capital in the second half of the 1650s, as the Commonwealth was invaded by Russians and Swedes. A smaller group of Jesuits from Poland-Lithuania was sent in the eighteenth century to Prague, to improve the knowledge of mathematics and physics under Joseph Stepling.⁴

Although the author extensively uses Czech, German, Polish and Latin historiography, some additional works would have been useful: Paul Shores' study *The Eagle and the Cross: Jesuits in late Baroque Prague* (Saint Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2002) and Alessandro Catalano's *La Boemia e la riconquista delle coscienze. Ernst Adalbert von Harrach e la Controriforma in Europa centrale (1620-1667)* (Roma, Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura, 2005). An interesting edited source is Stanislav Vydra's *Vita Admodum Reverendi Ac Magnifici Viri Iosephi Stepling, In Vniversitae Pragensi AA. LL. Et Philosophiae Doctoris, Caesar. Reg. Societatis Agriculturae Et AA. LL. In Regno Bohemiae Membri, Facoltatis Philosophicae Qvoad Physicam Et Mathesim In Vniversitate Pragensi Caesareo-Regii Directoris Ac Praesidis* (Pragae: Sumptibus Caes. Reg. Scholae Normalis. Typis, per Ioannem Adamum Hagen, 1779), containing a few letters by Tomasz Żebrowski.⁵ More extensive use of the annual catalogues published by László Lukács would have allowed describing more precisely the educational profile of the Clementinum before 1623.

Some inaccuracies can also be pointed out. The following statement: "The entire philosophical course was supplemented by mathematics" (p. 40) is wrong since according to the 1599 version of the *Ratio studiorum* the teaching of mathematics was limited to the second year of the philosophic course devoted to Aristotelian physics. Defining the mobility of Jesuit scholastics as academic peregrination (p. 66) is controversial since these did not choose where to study according to their will or cultural preferences, but rather were bound to the decision of their superiors. Moreover, they usually remained in the province where they had undertaken the novitiate. Attributing career ambitions to Jesuits (p. 165) is also debatable. A consideration of St. Ignatius' doctrine of obedience and more generally to the influence of Jesuit spirituality on decision

4 Joseph Stepling, * 29.VI.1716 Regensburg, SJ 9.X.1733 Brno, † 11.VII.1778 Prague (DHCJ IV, 3638).

5 Tomasz Żebrowski, * 25.XI.1714 Novogrudok (Belarus), SJ 6.VIII.1732 Novogrudok, † 18.III.1758 Vilnius Belarus (DHCJ IV, 4072).

making lend themselves to rectifying such wording. The author could also have better emphasized the influence of the Spanish Jesuit Rodrigo Arriaga⁶ and his innovative interpretation of the Aristotelian tradition on the philosophic and scientific formation of Polish and Lithuanian Jesuits. Although in the mid-1650s Arriaga was no longer teaching, some Jesuits educate in Prague later showed particular interest in new trends. This was the case of Wojciech Tytkowski,⁷ the main Polish representative of the *philosophia curiosa*.

Regardless of these critical remarks, Robert Tomczak's book remains a fundamental contribution to research on the activity of the Society of Jesus in early modern Central Europe.

Adam Mickiewicz University, Poznań

Andrea Mariani

Josep Buades Ferrer SJ, ed., *Textos para crecer en devoción: IV centenario de san Alonso Rodríguez: «Ya voy Señor»*. Bilbao: Ediciones Mensajero 2018. 238pp. ISBN 9788427142268.

Con ocasión del IV Centenario de la muerte de San Alonso Rodríguez, el hermano jesuita que, nacido en Segovia, dedicó sus años de madurez a la portería del colegio de Montesión, en Palma de Mallorca (España), los jesuitas mallorquines y algunos amigos laicos, escribieron diferentes textos para hacer llegar a la opinión pública mallorquina la figura y personalidad de este santo tan humilde que tanta notoriedad alcanzó en la isla, de la que es patrón. Alonso proporciona a los firmantes de los textos aludidos tantas facetas que, encerrado en las estrechas paredes de su portería colegial, permite sugestivas aproximaciones, sobre todo en su dimensión espiritual pero también en sus rasgos humanos, tan relevantes a la hora de conjugar humanidad y santidad.

La obra se divide en cinco capítulos, tras una oportuna presentación del editor. El primero acoge sendas cartas del P. General y del P. Provincial, en las que se insiste precisamente en la vocación jesuita de hermano en cuanto tal, de tanta actualidad

6 Rodrigo de Arriaga, * 1.I.1592 Logroño (Spain), SJ 17.IX.1606 Logroño, † 7.VI.1667 Prague (DHCJ I, p. 243).

7 Wojciech Tytkowski, * 19.IV.1628 Przasnysz (Poland), SJ 1.II.1646 Vilnius, † 14.I.1695 Warsaw (DHCJ IV, p. 3852–53).

en nuestra cultura actual. Cinco conferencias llenan el segundo capítulo, entre las que destacamos la del Dr. D. Pedro de Montaner, titulada "San Alonso Rodríguez y la Mallorca de su tiempo (1571-1617)", porque propone un marco social, político, económico y religioso un tanto desconocido y del todo necesario para comprender mejor la santidad de Alonso. El tercer capítulo lo llenan 6 artículos, aparecidos en diferentes periódicos y revistas, casi todos coincidentes en el binomio santidad-humildad, que llama la atención de los autores, además de insistir en la relación entre Alonso y Mallorca, capítulo de corte más periodístico y por lo tanto más divulgativo. Las respectivas homilías de los obispos de Segovia y de Mallorca. ocupan el cuarto capítulo, ambas centradas en la obediencia del segoviano trasladado a Mallorca, cumbre de esa humildad tan repetida en todas las aportaciones anteriores. Y en fin, bajo el título de "Otros", alcanzamos el quinto capítulo de la obra, donde se recogen actos, reuniones, proclamaciones, toda una serie de datos relevantes para comprender las celebraciones del centenario. El conjunto cuenta con un Prólogo del cardenal jesuita Luis Francisco Ladaria, en torno al lema tantas veces repetido por Alonso como portero siempre disponible y siempre místico: "Ya voy, Señor".

Un volumen sencillo y diáfano en su edición, de enorme utilidad para aproximarse al santo hermano jesuita, con aportaciones asequibles y llamativa precisión histórica, que permite el acceso a las pocas biografías existentes. Todo lo cual nos hace desear un texto biográfico a la altura del santo en cuestión, todavía inexistente.

Palma de Mallorca

Norberto Alcover SJ

